Spierenburg, M.J.

published in
Journal of Modern African Studies
2007

DOI (link to publisher)
10.1017/s0022278x06292425

document version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link to publication in VU Research Portal

citation for published version (APA)

General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
• You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
• You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:
vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Download date: 22. Apr. 2024

MARJA SPIERENBURG

DOI: 10.1017/S0022278X02274091, Published online: 12 September 2002

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0022278X02274091

How to cite this article:

Request Permissions : Click here
Mozambique and the Construction of the New African State: from negotiations to nation building by Chris Alden

Chris Alden provides a tightly woven account of international efforts to construct a ‘viable post-conflict state in Mozambique’ in the aftermath of sixteen years of civil war. For Alden, the international approach to Mozambique’s threefold post-war transition – from war to peace, from state-centred to market economy, and from party-state to formal democracy – reflects a larger consensus among donors and multilateral institutions from the UN to the World Bank, on the best strategy for rehabilitating the African continent as a whole and indeed for post-conflict cases the world over.

This model, the author argues, is deeply flawed both in concept and execution, and he uses Mozambique, an oft-touted success story, to make his case. Alden argues that the ‘liberal internationalist’ dream of capitalist liberal democracy built on an internationally mediated peace agreement can work only where, as in Mozambique, the international community is prepared to take financial as well as more direct intervention to unprecedented levels. ‘Post-conflict Mozambique and its erstwhile construction remains an anomaly, the product of a relatively brief episode of accelerated international activism in Africa’ (p. 120). Such commitment, he reminds us, is not likely to be forthcoming on a regular basis.

The book offers a brisk, accessible account of Mozambique’s journey from a socialist party-state mired in violent internal conflict and regional destabilisation to one of the premier success stories proffered both by the international financial institutions and for UN multifunctional peacekeeping in the wake of the Cold War. Chapter 1 is a concise overview of the essential economic, political and social antecedents of this journey, and chapter 2 outlines the elite-driven process of negotiation which would make economic and political liberalism the cornerstone of the peace agreement and the post-conflict state.

The two remaining substantive chapters, both dealing with the role of international actors in the formal peace process and its aftermath, lay the necessary groundwork for the book’s central argument – that Mozambique’s qualified success exemplifies more than anything else the limitations of the prevailing international approach to rebuilding war-torn and other deeply troubled African states. Particularly welcome in these chapters is the author’s attention to the complex and evolving roles played by international non-governmental organisations in the process.

By convincingly situating Mozambique’s transition process within the larger context of an increasingly uniform international approach to rebuilding
troubled states throughout the developing world, the book makes an important contribution. Mozambique’s is an important and understudied experience, and Alden uses it to craft a thoughtful cautionary account of the limits of negotiated peace and economic and political liberalism in Africa. It is in highlighting the extensive international intervention this model requires that the book makes its greatest impact. It is not always clear, however, whether the main problem is that the model is infeasible, has never been properly carried out, or is undesirable even if it could be properly implemented. Nor does the author indicate the elements of a more desirable approach.

And while the book does a good job of outlining international involvement in Mozambique’s threefold transition over the past decade, the evaluation of the results for domestic politics is at times somewhat superficial. Nor is it informed by any substantive exploration of the mechanisms or dynamics of social and political change in general, and of liberalism in particular. Political, sociological and economic accounts of institution-building, for example, suggest that habituation to new sets of rules is a long-term, non-linear process, in which rules are introduced and imperfectly practised and only gradually internalised. Where then should we look for evidence of change in the short term? Though the establishment of formal democratic institutions and market-based economies have, unsurprisingly, failed to transform Mozambican politics in this period, the placing of such reforms on the table has served to create political space and has brought to the surface fundamental struggles over both the principles and practice of allocating political and economic resources. Political assassinations, violent demonstrations and electoral boycotts provide striking and disturbing evidence of these struggles. But less visible outcomes can also be found. Mozambique’s tough-minded independent media, while resting on a slender base, has had measurable impact on the way in which the business of politics is conducted in Mozambique. The advent of electoral competition has occasioned subtle but important changes in the balance of power within both major parties. There is of course no telling what might be the end result of these changes. But they deserve more thorough consideration than they are given here.

CARRIE MANNING
Georgia State University

Violence and Memory: one hundred years in the ‘dark forests’ of Matabeleland by JOCelyn ALEXANDer, JOAnn McGREGOR and TERENCE RANGER

This is a complex and fascinating book. Its three authors have combined detailed archival research with the extensive collection of oral testimonies to present a history of the Shangani Reserve (the districts of Lupane and Nkayi) in Zimbabwe’s Matabeleland. Their narrative is shaped by the theme of
violence, beginning with the colonial conquest of 1893 and ending with the brutal suppression of post-liberation ‘dissidents’ in the 1980s. They champion the recovery of Matabeleland’s ‘hidden history’, integrating Shangani and its people into the story of Zimbabwe’s nationalist struggle and seeking to understand the significance of violence in that history. As well as describing the experience of various forms of violence in the Shangani, they explain why memories of these events have been ignored in the canon of national history. This is revisionist history in the best sense of that term – challenging the orthodox view of an established historiography by bringing to light new data and subjecting it to fresh interpretations.

Shangani’s ‘dark forests’ were the remote and disease-ridden frontier zone to the north of Bulawayo into which the defeated Ndebele were expelled after their defeats at the hands of European colonists in the 1890s. The first part of the book tells the story of the conquest of the Ndebele, their forced evictions from lands to be given the Europeans, their settlement into the barren and tsetse-fly infested Shangani, their interactions with other groups already resident in the area, and the eventual forging of a rural nationalist movement in the Shangani. It is a story of dislocation, integration and (ultimately) transformation. The familiar themes of ethnicity, religion, rural capitalism, nationalism and environmental change all loom large in the telling of this tale, but it is violence that Alexander, McGregor and Ranger see as the key to understanding the history of the region. Violence takes three distinct forms: the violence of colonial conquest; the violence of the colonial state in imposing its authority over the rural population; and the violence of nationalism, culminating in the emergence of guerrilla war in the 1960s.

The second part of the book concentrates on the final phase of the liberation war in Shangani in the mid-1970s, the traumatic assault on Shangani’s ‘dissidents’ in the 1980s and the reconstruction of social order (of a kind) in the past decade. Part 2 of Violence and Memory also poses important questions for our understanding of African nationalism and its evolution from the 1960s to the present. Oral testimonies contribute hugely to these chapters, bringing an immediacy and passion to the story. These chapters present the best account yet available of Zimbabwe’s dreadful violence in the 1980s, and should be essential reading for all those interested in understanding the nature of the post-colony in Africa. In the light of international concern over the question of land appropriation in Zimbabwe in recent months, one is left to wonder why others stood by and watched such horrendous events take place in the recent past.

The literature on violence in Africa is dominated by the related issues of reconciliation and post-conflict reconstruction. Much of this literature is arid, self-evident and inadequately researched. It is therefore refreshing, and highly informative, to encounter a study of this kind which documents and describes violence within a fully elaborated historical context. In understanding violence, detail and context matter; and while social scientists may be frustrated that the authors of Violence and Memory have largely ignored social theories of violence, they will surely welcome the emphasis upon events and their gestation. This is an important book that should be widely read.

David M. Anderson

School of Oriental and African Studies

The book is a result of an international conference on ‘Land Reform in Zimbabwe: the way forward’ held in March 1998 at the University of London’s School of Oriental and African Studies. It therefore predates the wave of violent takeover of mostly white owned farms that started in February 2000. Chapter 1 by Bowyer-Bower and Stoneman gives a useful summary of the sixteen chapters in the book. Their observation that ‘all agree that land reform is essential, but disagreement among the parties on how it should be undertaken has made sustainable land reform impossible’ (p. 13) in part explains the current violent phase in the land reform crisis.

In chapter 2, Palmer shows that the land problem is common to other African countries with a colonial heritage. What is shown as unique to Zimbabwe at the time is the emerging method of redressing the imbalance. In chapter 3, Cusworth discusses the key findings of the 1988 UK ODA Evaluation of the Land Reform Programme Report and the 1996 Land Appraisal Mission. He observes that in spite of the former report concluding that up to 1987 the programme had been a qualified success, and the latter report suggesting a new programme of phased land resettlement, opportunities to follow through a programme of planned and orderly land reform by both the Zimbabwe state and the donors were missed.

Chapter 4 by Cliffe discusses the politics that surround land reform in Zimbabwe as an explanation of both the pace and form of resettlement. He argues that the development of bureaucratic and political elites and the internationalisation of what is essentially a local problem served to influence the form and pace of land reform. In chapter 5, Stoneman gives a summary of what at the time was the state’s programme of planned resettlement. Its desire for a land reform programme that would attract funding but at the same time satisfy local expectations emerges as a key factor tempering the type of land reform the state could pursue at the time. Views of other non-state stakeholders are summarised in chapter 6 by Bowyer-Bower. The difference in emphasis and the positions of their respective constituencies emerge clearly in this summary. While members of the Commercial Farmers Union (who owned the land to be redistributed) argued for fair compensation for their land, the union representing the potential beneficiaries (mostly communal farmers) were more concerned with the quality of the land, beneficiary selection, support services to settlements, and increased investment in the communal areas.

In chapter 7, Moyo considers the possible outcomes of the state’s intention to compulsorily acquire 1,471 farms. He argues for an analysis and policy articulation that shows not only the economic costs of the said land transfers...
but also the economic benefits that could accrue. In chapter 8, Bowyer-Bower looks at the 1995 Poverty Assessment Study as the social context of land reform, interpreting its results as showing endemic poverty in the rural areas, and the areas that will need attention in future programmes.

Kinsey’s contribution in chapter 9 looks at emerging outcomes of land resettlement on the livelihoods of beneficiaries. Based on a longitudinal study of resettled households, Kinsey’s work shows that resettled households have higher and more evenly distributed income than their communal lands counterparts. Crucially, households are shown to have made considerable progress in accumulating assets. Better incomes and assets are however shown not to have translated into better nutrition. Positive perceptions of the welfare effects of resettlement are also noted in the chapter 10 by Potts. Based on a different longitudinal survey of migrants’ perceptions, the paper shows that migrants consider the resettlement programme positively, but for too much state control of livelihoods and restrictive selection procedures. In chapter 11 Alexander discusses how institutional memory and inertia have had an enduring influence on the implementation of resettlement. In particular, she shows how the domination of technocrats in planning and the adoption of rigid models of resettlement has survived and endured the transition from the settler to the post-colonial state.

Four of the chapters in the book address specific emerging issues from the resettlement programme. In chapter 12, Elliot addresses the issue of the environment and resource use patterns in resettlement areas. This is one of the few studies to quantify changes in woodland cover in the resettlement, and hence provides valuable insight into the effect of resettlement on resource use patterns at household and settlement level. In chapters 13 and 14, Coldham and Brown examine issues related to land inheritance, highlighting areas of customary law that potentially still work against women.

Jacobs’ paper in chapter 15 considers how land reform has affected social relations at household level. Her contribution illuminates emerging social trends that have implications for future design and implementation of resettlement programmes. Crucially, she documents the social transformation in household labour dynamics and the changing social roles of respective genders. Chapter 16 by Rukuni is a classical policy analysis articulation of the land reform issue, analysing the context of the land reform and proposing sixteen resettlement options covered by four land reform models. The chapter therefore presents a blueprint for proceeding with the land reform, and also suggests the institutional, legal and financial context of the programme. It reads like a counter thesis to the state programme proffered in chapter 5.

In general, the book offers valuable insight into emerging outcomes of land resettlement just before the farm invasions began. Although overtaken by the fast changing developments on the ground, the book is still an important record of the policy debates that preceded the unfolding crisis. With short and succinct chapters by prominent scholars and practitioners from various disciplines, the book makes easy reading of a complex area of study. The short postscript describing events that unfolded as the book was in print does not however do justice to the developments that radically changed the prospects for a planned, fair and transparent land reform process. The book is published
in hardback, and this of course is a factor that may price it out of the reach of a Zimbabwe-based readership caught in a declining economy.

Admos O. Chimhoyu
University of Zimbabwe

The Uncertain Promise of Southern Africa edited by York Bradshaw and Stephen N. Ndegwa

Bradshaw and Ndegwa have assembled a talented group of scholars to address the problems faced by six Southern African nations: Angola, Botswana, South Africa, Mozambique, Namibia and Zimbabwe. In addition to separate chapters dealing with each country, and an introductory chapter by the editors, thematic essays deal with balance of power (Colin Legum), popular culture (David B. Coplan), gendered terrains (Jean Davison), law and gender (Chuma Himonga), education (Bruce Fuller and Allen Caldwell), health and society (Ezekiel Kalpeni), economic integration (Sue Kell and Troy Dyer) and data for the quantitative analysis of Southern Africa (Liezell Bradshaw). Numerous references to the other nations of the area – Lesotho, Malawi, Swaziland and Zambia – are in the thematic essays.

Legum’s essay on ‘Balance of Power in Southern Africa’ provides statistics to show just how overwhelming the dominance of the Republic is by comparison with its neighbours: with only one third of the population of the area it has 75 per cent of the GDP (p. 12). He discusses the reluctance of South Africa to use its military on peace keeping in Africa and the ANC’s insistence on keeping the nation’s naval forces under strength. The navy needs vessels, including several submarines, to protect its fishing grounds from depredations by factory ships of foreign powers (p. 17). He concludes that South Africa prefers a low profile and is not interested in playing a hegemonic role in the region (p. 22).

Kenneth Grundy is best known for his work on the South African military. Here he examines ‘South Africa: transition to majority rule, transformation to stable democracy’. While much of his article traces the circumstances leading to the election of 1994, he concludes with a summary of the problems the nation faces and an analysis of the difficulties the ANC faces in holding their alliance with the working class together.

The weakness of Masipula Sithole’s ‘Zimbabwe: the erosion of authoritarianism and prospects for democracy’, is that events have left it far behind. The use by President Mugabe of veterans of their war for independence, who have been sent in to seize white-owned farms without compensation, has left the Zimbabwe dollar virtually valueless. The strength of this article is in the details it relates of infighting within parliament against Mugabe’s tactics and the general unrest of the population, food riots and student unrest.
Joshua Bernard Forrest in ‘Democracy and development in post-independent Namibia’ examines the evolution of presidential power as Sam Njoma consolidates more and more authority at the very centre of government, so that the president and a few old hands constitute an in-group while younger radicals concerned about social issues are ignored. Forrest notes that among seven Southern African nations surveyed in 1997, the Helen Suzman Foundation found that ‘only in Namibia did most respondents declare that they were able to criticize their government and to hold public demonstrations without harassment by the state’ (p. 110).

All the following chapters are of some interest, but that on Botswana by Holm and Darnoff is particularly so because of its long relationship with South Africa, since many of the Tswana people live there in what was in apartheid days Bophuthatswana. The discovery of diamonds shortly after the country’s independence provided a fortunate economic windfall for the country.

Bradshaw and Ndegwa’s book will provide a solid basic reference for Southern Africa for some time to come.

DALVAN M. COGER
University of Memphis

Pensions in Development by ROGER CHARLTON and RODDY MCKINNON

The first part of the book examines the evolution of debates about pensions, focusing on the role of international organisations such as the World Bank and the International Labour Organisation. The second part examines the role of pensions in particular regions. These include a chapter on transition economies, and one on provident funds (largely referring to south-east Asia). The book also includes a chapter dealing with links between pensions and capital markets.

Two chapters of particular interest include a discussion of sub-Saharan Africa experiences, and an examination of alternative strategies for low-income countries. The authors are frank about the many failings of pensions programmes and provident funds in the region, including very low rates of population coverage, maladministration and corruption. However, the authors do not conclude that formal social protection programmes are intrinsically unsuited to the region. On one hand, they recognise the scale of obstacles such as resource limitations, weak institutional capacities and highly informalised labour markets. On the other, they observe that externally imposed structural adjustment policies have also had much to do with the financial crisis of funds in many countries.

The authors draw attention to the existence of successful non-contributory pension programmes in several countries, including Botswana, Namibia and South Africa. They note that such programmes may not be unfeasibly
expensive (particularly if donors could be persuaded of their usefulness), and that even very small pensions appear to have a significant impact on the wellbeing of poor elders, and other household members. Similarly, the national provident fund operating in The Gambia is widely perceived as a ‘model’ of well-managed social welfare. As such, the experience of sub-Saharan Africa is not uniformly bleak, and provides the basis for a number of suggestions made by the authors. These include a need to up-grade the role of non-contributory social assistance programmes, whilst carefully integrating these with informal support mechanisms. The authors suggest that universal coverage might be achieved by gradually extending coverage to different groups of workers of geographical regions.

The authors note that current knowledge about the condition of older people in Africa is extremely scarce. This may have important consequences for the design of pensions and social protection. For example, do Western notions of retirement at age 60 really apply in settings where patterns of chronological ageing may be very different? What are the implications of provision for dependants in a country such as Senegal, with a tradition of polygamy and large age differences between spouses? Whilst current knowledge about the realities of old age in Africa is indeed thin, perhaps a little more could have been done to explore these issues.

The book is a significant contribution to debates about formal social protection, pensions and older people in the South. It offers a refreshingly original alternative to the existing policy frameworks, and hopefully its readership will extend beyond those working on pensions. Some of the earlier chapters are a little technical and assume quite a lot of specialised knowledge about pension systems on the part of the reader. Nevertheless, the chapters on sub-Saharan Africa and low-income countries are very accessible and can probably be read in isolation.

Peter Lloyd-Sherlock
University of East Anglia

From Dictatorship to Democracy: economic policy in Malawi 1964–2000 by Jane Harrigan

This particularly good book approaches economics in quite a mechanical way, and a mathematical model in the middle of the book seems to be the crux of the argument. This reader is not only easily lost in such models, but also sees economic life as created primarily by actors, rather than people beings cogs in a machine or model. However, I found the book rich reading, despite appearances to the contrary. It is in the first place a story about actors: its proper subject is the engagement of the International Financial Institutions (IFIs) with the Malawi government. These are not treated as single big homogeneous identities; rather, positions holding various views are differen-
tiated within them. Harrigan not only documents the way in which the World Bank staff groped around in their attempt to understand structural adjustment in Malawi, but also has a keen eye for the influence of seemingly neutral bureaucratic matters. For example, the pressure to disburse money, as the allocation would lapse at the end of the fiscal year in the case of IDA loans, led to light conditionality. The shift from project to programme lending is elucidated. In Malawi, this meant that the World Bank was at a certain point at loggerheads with itself: stimulating the uptake of inputs in the World Bank funded National Rural Development Project and arguing for the gradual abolition of fertiliser subsidies in programme lending. The chapter on the Bank’s diagnosis and prescriptions is superior teaching material in any course on programme lending or structural adjustment.

Although it is of interest to a much wider audience than those interested in Malawi, it is also rich as a reference work on the Malawi economy. Essential episodes in Malawi economic history are described here more clearly than before. Two notable examples are the reconstruction of Press Corporation in the early 1980s, and the role of the fertiliser subsidy in negotiating the Agricultural Structural Adjustment Credit (ASAC) around 1990. In discussing the Malawi economy, Harrigan again lifts her work to a much broader relevance. She depicts Malawian development in the first decades of independence as similar to the East Asian experience. The merits or demerits of state-led development in an ostensibly capitalist context is at the heart of her analysis of IFI thinking on Malawi. The IFIs were brought in around 1980 in response to the foreign exchange crisis. Malawi seemed to have succeeded in adjusting in the mid 1980s, but that was a deception, and IFIs have remained of prime importance in the Malawi economy. The difficulties in adjusting the Malawi economy, according to Harrigan, stem primarily from a lack of understanding on the part of the IFIs of the Malawi agrarian economy. The crisis was primarily rooted in the peasant sector, because this sector was being squeezed by the large-scale estate sector, where primarily the Malawian elite farmed tobacco. Reviving the peasant sector was therefore the key to adjustment.

According to Harrigan, the Bank’s policy conditions, particularly with respect to pricing, had as a consequence in the smallholder sector: ‘a decline in food crop production, which was acute in the case of improved maize varieties, and an associated shift towards export production; a slow down in the rate of smallholder fertiliser uptake; a deterioration in smallholder real incomes; an ADMARC (state agricultural marketing corporation) cash crisis which placed demands on the Central Government budget; an adverse balance of payments effect in the form of maize import’ (p. 136). This quotation not only sums up a major part of the argument, but points as well to the limitations of her analysis: it assumes a deep understanding of economic life as a mechanical process that is primarily determined by government economic policy. The analysis would have been more convincing if she had left more room for the unknown. Central in the argument is a pessimistic reassessment of the performance of the non-cash peasant sector. This, I think, replaces one guess by another, as we simply know very little about this sector. Above all, we need to know more about the production decisions made on the
Harrigan argues convincingly that price elasticity of aggregate supply in the smallholder sector was likely to be low, as smallholders faced enormous resource constraints limiting their options. There is price elasticity of individual crops: within their limits, smallholders shift from one crop to another. While undertaking qualitative work I found, however, that the decision to plant maize, including the use of inputs, is constrained by cash factors, but otherwise not guided by economic calculations. Alan’s theory of the normal surplus seems not to have lost actuality: smallholder farmers plant as much maize as they can. ‘Maize is food’ and it has a cultural value that cannot be compared with other crops. Our lack of knowledge about the smallholder sector is also evident in the chapter on the period 1994–2000, where contrary to the confident expectations of a new agricultural policy (outlined on pp. 295–6) the peasant sector is not lifted out of stagnation. Indeed, maize production and marketing remain highly problematic (pp. 300–4). This does not diminish the significance of Harrigan’s book. On the contrary, reading this book made me again realise how stimulating it is to be challenged by a really good book.

Finally, I think that the title is misleading: this book is primarily about economics, and politics is merely the setting from which economic policy emerges. Economic policy-making is indeed the subject of this book, but it does not really cover the period 1964–2000. The period 1980–90 is its major focus, and we are only gradually coming to understand what happened in Malawi after 1994. Democracy and economic policy-making in Malawi require another book.

JANKEE VAN DONGE
The Hague
conservation’, using Leach & Mearns and Roe’s ideas on ‘development narratives’. They claim that the counter-narrative was mainly developed outside Africa, perhaps with the exception of Zimbabwe, and give an interesting overview of the influence of donors, international environmental organisations and individuals. Murphree and Barrow problematise the concept of the community. They try to come to grips with the dilemma that despite the fact that communities are hard to define and their compositions change all the time, resource users do need to organise themselves for collective action for effective natural resource management. They formulate a number of characteristics required for successful organisations and define three broad categories of community conservation initiatives: protected area outreach, collaborative management and community-based conservation.

The second part of the book reviews specific examples of the reforms that have occurred in public policy and institutions. In Namibia and Zimbabwe (Jones, Murphree) policy has emphasised commercial exploitation of wildlife on communal lands, involving some form of devolution of decision-making, but leaving unaddressed the issue of communities dispossessed by the establishment of National Parks. In East Africa (Barrow, Gichohi, Infield) policy has concentrated on parks outreach, which involves practically no devolution of decision-making powers. Anstey describes how in Mozambique a lengthy period of ‘no policy’ has been followed by aid-financed policies of community conservation running parallel with community-based natural resource management and private sector activity. Bergin describes the organisational changes at TANAPA as it adopted and implemented the concept of community conservation.

Part 3 examines the community conservation components of park outreach projects in Uganda (Hulme and Infield; Adams and Infield) and Tanzania (Kangwana and Ole Mako). The studies indicate that the projects contributed to better relations between Parks staff and local communities, diminished poaching, and enhanced the flow of benefits to local residents, but it is argued that this does not compensate for the loss of exploitable natural resources to conservation.

Part 4 examines more devolutionary approaches in which communities gain significant control over important wildlife resources in Namibia (Jones) and Zimbabwe (Murphree). In Namibia the process of devolution of control over wildlife has preceded the development of legislation concerning local government, whereas in Zimbabwe control is vested in existing local government structures. Both cases show that favourable community–private enterprise relations are needed if communities want to capture a significant share of value added wildlife utilisation. Another chapter on Mozambique looks at indigenous community conservation and natural resource management (Anstey and De Sousa).

Part 5 looks at economics, incentives and institutional change. Emerton points out that while sharing benefits derived from parks or wildlife has strengthened benefit flows, rural Africans still lose out in economic terms when Protected Areas are declared or wildlife protected. Murombedzi presents a rather bleak future for community conservation, as he argues that most villagers in CAMPFIRE see ‘development’ as agriculture, roads, schools and
higher population densities. Bond concludes that CAMPFIRE has created only small benefits per capita, and little institutional change at the community level, but high benefits and changes at an intermediate level in local government structures.

Part 6 examines the ecological impacts of community conservation. Kangwana argues that the scientific assessment of the ecological impacts of community conservation is fraught with difficulties because of the many other factors that can influence ecological impacts, the lack of possibilities for (semi-) experiments with areas with and without interference, and difficulties in determining spatial and time scales for impact measurements. Taylor argues that scientific approaches to environmental assessment (in particular, with reference to measuring wildlife populations) often have low reliability and proposes participatory strategies, which combine assessment with management and permit different stakeholders to provide their knowledge about population trends.

Hulme and Murphree conclude by noting that community conservation approaches have taken many forms and that assessing the various costs and benefits is problematic in terms of methodologies and resources. The evidence from the case studies indicates that community conservation initiatives have generally been beneficial for communities when compared to ‘fortress conservation’, but that the scale of improvement is generally limited, and that they have made conservation only marginally more acceptable to communities. The direct effects of community conservation on the environment are unclear, yet there is evidence from the case studies that it can shape the behaviour of local residents in patterns that are more compatible with conservation goals. But future loss of conservation resources is unavoidable with growing populations with rising aspirations, integrating into a global economy.

This book is a must for all who are working on community conservation, scholars and practitioners alike. But perhaps I am a little biased, since one of the editors, Marshall Murphree, is the person who first introduced me to the community conservation narrative. He is one of these individuals who were so important for the diffusion of the narrative in southern Africa that figure in so many of the case studies, though he does not appear in the stories on CAMPFIRE.

The descriptions in Part 2 of the diffusion of the concept of community conservation in the different regions/countries are very interesting. However, the developments are presented in a somewhat linear fashion. There is very little attention for inconsistencies, contradictions or setbacks as result of power struggles within governments/conservation bureaucracies. In many cases it must have been a ‘one-step-forward-two-steps-back’ process, as is indeed indicated in the epilogue of Bergin’s study on TANAPA (or in the conclusion when the cycles of enchantment and disenchantment affecting donor programmes are discussed). The editors stress that community conservation is not simply a technical process, but a political one that attempts to redistribute social and political power, yet relatively little attention is paid to this. In some accounts differences of opinions within (different levels) of conservation bureaucracies or central governments are described, and remarks are made...
about vested interests that are defended, but the political unwillingness of many bureaucracies and governments to truly devolve ownership of resources is not explicitly addressed. However, given the current political climate in some of the countries that feature in the book, and the fact that most authors will continue to work there, this is perhaps understandable.

The case studies are more explicit about differences of opinion and conflicts within organisations and communities. The volume draws on a rather limited number of community conservation initiatives. At first sight this may seem a setback, but it may also turn out to be an advantage: some initiatives are described from different angles by different authors, providing a better insight on the complexities and, sometimes, inconsistencies. CAMPFIRE is one of the best-represented initiatives in the volume, maybe because research and monitoring have been an integral part of the programme since its inception. It gives rise to two of the most critical studies in the volume, clearly showing the problems posed to community conservation in a context of high levels of poverty, where highly mobile communities need to diversify their strategies as much as possible, especially as their tenure of resources is uncertain. Most initiatives (and the title of the volume) focus on wildlife, but land tenure is a recurrent theme in the book as well.

Many believers in the ‘fortress conservation narrative’ reproach authors on community conservation with neglecting the environmental impacts. This volume does address them, but Kangwana shows why they are so difficult to include in evaluations. I doubt whether ‘fortress conservationists’ will be convinced by this volume, since narratives generally are not judged by their actual achievements. Most authors of this volume may not give up their belief in the counter-narrative either, but they have demonstrated that they are able to look critically at its rather mixed results.

Marja Spierenburg
Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam


DOI: 10.1017/S0022278002249809 Printed in the United Kingdom

**Is Apartheid Really Dead? Pan Africanist working class cultural critical perspectives** by Julian Kunnie


Julian Kunnie has an ambitious agenda in this volume. As the title indicates, he explores whether the transfer of power from the white regime to the African majority ended apartheid, or merely shifted it from a political to an economic context. He examines this question from the perspective of a class analysis, and couches all of his arguments in the language of the ‘revolutionary working-class struggle’. This perspective is leavened with pan-Africanist and Black Consciousness Movement views and tries to put South Africa’s indigenous people and women at the analytic centre of the struggle. Finally, and most provocatively, he issues a call for a genuine transformation of South Africa through armed revolutionary action.
This makes for an interesting ideological pastiche. Kunnie begins his book with an overview of South African history from the perspective of the oppressed and the indigenous population. It is interesting though necessarily superficial. In chapter 2 his assessment of the forces behind the events of 2 February 1990 – the unbanning of the African National Congress, the Pan Africanist Congress and the South African Communist Party, the release of political prisoners including Nelson Mandela and the launch of a process that led to the election of a majority government – is convincing. He suggests that it was a combination of the demise of the Soviet Union – that deprived both the ANC of a patron and the government of an internationally viable rationale for oppression – and the pressure of world capitalism that persuaded the white politicians that it was time to deal. Better to give up political power if that will allow a continuing firm grip on the economy. ‘The white ruling regime in South Africa’, Kunnie writes, ‘sought to find creative ways to ensure its very survival, particularly in the interest of preserving the domination of capital by “any means necessary”’ (p. 64).

In successive chapters the author provides an analysis of the neocolonial political economy in South Africa, gives a ‘Pan-Africanist/Black working-class’ view of other African political economies, looks at Pan-Africanism and the ongoing struggle against colonialism and neocolonialism, examines the trade union movement and the prospects for revolution in South Africa/Azania, with particular emphasis on the role of women in that struggle.

None of this analysis makes any pretence at being “balanced”. Though cloaked in the trapping of scholarship with extensive footnotes and academic language, Kunnie’s book is a screed, questioning the very foundations of the current South African polity and calling for a violent, armed revolution. This revolution would rise in the South African black working class, be animated by indigenous spirituality and be ‘female affirming’ (p. 185).

Some of his praxis will be chilling, especially in light of the current chaos and bloodshed on white farms in Zimbabwe. He says, ‘The only real solution to the bestiality of neocolonial capitalist oppression in South Africa is also the most difficult one: revolution. The days of a “yes-baas! No-baas” culture will come to pass, and the mental and psychological enslavement that Black workers suffer under the yoke of white power will be broken. Its rupture will only materialize by cultural and armed revolution, and Black workers need to accept and prepare for this eventuality. Authentic justice entails that the land stolen by white settlers be returned to the African people unconditionally and then redistributed according to nonracial principles’ (emphasis in the original, p. 202).

Most thoughtful observers will agree that the vestiges of apartheid linger and that the lives of ordinary South African blacks are almost as hard today as they were during the years of National Party rule. In that sense apartheid is not dead. However, it is one thing to conclude that the legacy of apartheid remains, and even that the capitalist structure helps perpetuate that legacy – it is quite another to think, as Kunnie argues, that an armed revolution would improve the lot of ordinary black South Africans.

J. BARRON BOYD
Le Moyne College
Political and military analyses saturate the historiography of the ‘French–Algerian War’ that was waged from 1954 to 1962. James Le Sueur considers a complementary and concurrent conflict – that among intellectuals. Taking advantage of private collections and increasingly available archival sources, the author adds a sense of immediacy by including interviews. The result is a rigorously researched intellectual history of Algerian decolonisation.

According to Le Sueur, the war was a seminal experience for intellectuals on each side of the Mediterranean. He argues persuasively that decolonisation deeply involved questions of public and private intellectual legitimacy, authenticity and identity. For example, the war challenged the vaunted universality of French ideals. It forced intellectuals to define, differentiate and defend positions, to formulate new theoretical frameworks or reimagine old ones, and ultimately to reconcile or rupture with the ‘other’.

The first part of the book considers efforts by intellectuals to generate a reconciliation between the French and the Algerians. To Jacques Soustelle, a famous anthropologist and eventually governor-general of Algeria, this meant inaugurating a policy of ‘integration’ – fundamentally a reworking of colonial assimilation. The emergence of the anticolonial Comité d’Action questioned Soustelle’s direction and urged democratic reform. Nevertheless, the Comité fractured over the Front de Libération (FLN) vs. Mouvement National Algérien (MNA) rivalry and fell apart over Suez and the Hungarian intervention.

Le Sueur views the Service des Centres Sociaux – institutions that provided educational opportunities and technical training – as a metaphor illustrating the difficulties of achieving reconciliation between the populations. Created by Soustelle to expedite integration, French authorities and ultras eventually viewed the Centres Sociaux as subversive. One of the greatest tragedies of the entire war occurred at the administration offices of the Centres in Algiers on 15 March 1962, when the extremist colonial Organisation de l’Armée Secrète (OAS) executed six men including the renowned Kabyle author, Mouloud Feraoun. This atrocity had profound symbolic significance for the potential of post-colonial French–Algerian accommodation.

Albert Camus’s rejected conciliatory proposals – the ‘civil truce’ and French–Algerian federation – left the Nobel Prize winner of 1957 disaffected and disillusioned. His subsequent silence over the escalating violence and his agitated comment that he ‘would defend my mother before justice’ further isolated him publicly and personally. Le Sueur presents Camus as an anomaly and anachronism during this tumultuous period – though Camus’s risking reconciliation was singularly courageous as well as quixotic. Yet as Mouloud Feraoun and Ahmed Taleb Ibrahimi suggested, Camus did not seem to
understand or recognise the need for Algerian rebellion and resistance. Nevertheless, he perceived that the war’s violence, particularly that perpetrated by the FLN, threatened to lead Algeria towards the authoritarianism and nihilism. As Le Sueur points out, the emergence of extremist political Islam decades later and the brutality of the Algerian Civil War have regenerated Camus’s reputation as a moralist and, sadly, a prophet.

The second part of the book examines the rupturing relationship. Raymond Aron begins this section with his conclusion that integration was politically, economically, and socially impossible. This provoked a hostile response by Soustelle who equated French disengagement with decadence. Germaine Tillion, who had hoped for reconciliation, feared the social and economic consequences of rupture, but she began to anticipate them.

The powerfully influential tandem of Jean-Paul Sartre and Frantz Fanon propelled the intellectual discourse into theoretical dialectical violence. There could be no reconciliation but only revolutionary transformation which meant inevitable Algerian independence. Fanon viewed violence as a means to purge Algeria’s French colonial identity and fashion a new humanity; Sartre enthusiastically agreed. Sartre’s descent into ‘dialectical reason and violence’ compelled particularly critical responses by Maurice Merleau-Ponty, Claude Lévi-Strauss and Jean Daniel.

The Affaire Audin and the torture of Henri Alleg, Djamila Bouhired and Djamila Boupacha rallied French intellectuals against their own government. This was especially illustrated by the Jeanson network and Manifesto of the 121. Therefore, rupture was occurring not only between the French and Algerians, but also among the French themselves.

In this increasingly alienated and hostile intellectual environment, Le Sueur introduces historian Jacques Berque, a native of Algeria whose father was a French colonial administrator. Berque’s acumen – his ideas on Orientalism predate those by Edward Said – perceived the essentially ontological effect of ‘othering’. He insisted upon the deep study of the other’s history and culture – an imperative also supported by Jean Amrouche. Implicitly, Berque rebuked Fanon and Sartre’s myopic theoretical perception of the war. Pierre Bourdieu explicitly repudiated it, claiming that Fanon and Sartre were particularly insensitive to the underlying, enduring nature of Islamic tradition – even in a convulsive revolutionary environment. Nevertheless, Berque and Bourdieu agreed with Fanon and Sartre that there had been substantial social and psychological changes in Algeria.

In his foreword to this book, Pierre Bourdieu refers to Le Sueur’s portraits of intellectuals as a ‘series of still shots’. Le Sueur has collected his pictures and has placed them in a remarkable album. His portrayals evince impressive breadth and depth of field. This book deserves immediate inclusion in academic libraries and specialists’ collections. It is a very welcome and, given its subject, a needed addition to French–Algerian decolonisation studies.

Phillip C. Naylor
Marquette University
Mahmood Mamdani joins a number of scholars who have attempted to explain the 1994 Rwandan tragedy in which many of the majority Hutu (about 85 per cent of the population) turned on the Tutsi (about 12 per cent of the population) and moderate Hutu, killing an estimated 800,000 people.

Mamdani opens When Victims Become Killers by expressing his growing discontent with the methodological claim that knowledge is about the production of facts coupled with a stubborn resistance to theory. I agree with Mamdani that coherent explanations require a theoretical framework. Those who claim that theory is not necessary may simply be oblivious of the presumptions and inferences that inform their own writing or may not understand the nature of explanation.

Mamdani claims this book is an attempt to rethink existing facts in a new light and to explain the popularity of the genocide. He asks why hundreds of thousands of Hutu, who had never before killed, took part in the slaughter. Before people eliminate an enemy, Mamdani explains, they need to define it. He argues that the Rwandan genocide needs to be thought through within the logic of colonialism, which created the native impulse to eliminate the settler. Following Franz Fanon, Mamdani says this impulse is more an affirmation of the native’s humanity than the brutal extinction of life.

The Tutsi, a group with a privileged relationship to power before and during colonialism, were constructed as a privileged alien settler presence, first by the colonialists, then by the Hutu revolution of 1959 and the Hutu Power propaganda from 1990 to 1994. During German and Belgian colonial rule and thereafter, Hutu was made into a native identity and Tutsi a settler one. In its motivation and construction, Mamdani argues, the Rwandan genocide needs to be understood as a natives’ genocide. It was a genocide by Hutu who saw themselves as sons and daughters of the soil, and their mission as one of clearing the soil of a threatening alien (Tutsi) presence. It was not an ethnic, but a racial cleansing. For the Hutu who killed, the Tutsi was a colonial settler, not a neighbour.

Most writers on the subject trace the recent Hutu–Tutsi distinction to the Belgians’ use of the 10 cow rule for the 1933–34 census and identity cards. Supposedly, any male who owned 10 cows was classified as a Tutsi; those with fewer than 10 cows were classified as Hutu. No explanation for Twa is usually given. Relying on a doctoral dissertation by Tharcisse Gatwa, Mamdani writes that the Belgians actually used three major sources of information for their census classification: ‘oral information provided by the church, physical measurements, and ownership of large herds of cows’ (p. 99). ‘The fact is’, writes Mamdani, ‘that the Belgian power did not arbitrarily cook up the Hutu/Tutsi distinction. What it did do was to take an existing sociopolitical distinction and racialize it’ (p. 99). ‘The origin of the violence is connected to
how Hutu and Tutsi were constructed as political identities by the colonial state, Hutu as indigenous and Tutsi as alien’ (p.34).

Mamdani categorises the 1994 civilian killings into two different kinds: (1) the killing of Tutsi civilians by Hutu mobs, and (2) the killing of Hutu by Hutu, either for political reasons (e.g. the killings of moderate Hutu willing to work with Tutsi) or for economic reasons (as when poor Hutu killed richer ones to take their property). The first type of killing alone is the focus of Mamdani’s concern. This narrowing of focus is one of the book’s weaknesses. Mamdani’s racialised political identity hypothesis cannot deal with the murder of Hutu by Hutu. A satisfactory theoretical explanation, however, must be able to deal with the mass murder of both Hutu and Tutsi, not only with the genocide (the killing of Tutsi by Hutu).

While Mamdani attributes the genocide to racialised political identities, he attributes the timing of the genocide to events in neighbouring Uganda, where so many Tutsi had sought refuge. When the Ugandan government established an ancestry requirement for Ugandan citizenship in 1990, it forced the refugee Tutsi there to reestablish themselves in Rwanda. Hence, Uganda exported its own political crisis to Rwanda in the form of the Rwandan Patriotic Front, which began a series of invasions into Rwanda in 1990.

Mamdani seems to believe that but for events in Uganda, the RPF invasion and subsequent genocide would not have occurred. ‘The Rwanda Patriotic Front (RPF) invasion of October 1990 occurred at a time of internal reform – and not repression – in Rwanda’ (p. 159). ‘On the eve of the RPF invasion … the Rwandan polity was healthier than many others in the region’ (p. 155). The Rwandan government allowed for multiparty politics and a free press. ‘The Second Republic promised “reconciliation” between Hutu and Tutsi. Branded an alien minority under the First Republic, the Tutsi were redefined, even rehabilitated, as a Rwandese minority under the Second Republic. … The 1990 RPF invasion changed this context dramatically’ (p. 189). After the invasion, the Hutu Power advocates reracialised Tutsi identity.

Mamdani is well aware of the drastic economic decline Rwanda experienced in the late 1980s and early 1990s as well as the ‘massive corruption’ in its government (p.151). He notes Rwanda’s growing population and land scarcity. However, he rejects these factors as causes of the genocide. ‘No matter how depressing these facts may seem, we need to keep in mind that there is no necessary connection between a drastic reduction in resources and deadly human conflict’ (p.198).

In response to Mamdani, one might add that there is no necessary connection between racial differences, immigration and genocide, as Mamdani seems to contend. Many countries contain populations of different races, ethnicities, and origins, but very few of them have ever experienced genocide. Mamdani’s approach is overly idealist and contradictory. He rejects infrastructural factors as causes of the genocide with the explanation that ‘humans shape their world based on human consciousness and human capacities’ (p.198). Could the Rwandans suffering from famine consciously will food on their tables or an abundant garden ready to be harvested when they had no land to plant? Could they consciously will a lower national debt, reduced inflation, higher world prices for their coffee, and a higher gross
national product per capita? Hardly. However, they could consciously will a reconceptualisation of Hutu-Tutsi political identities. Political identity is, after all, a purely mental concept; land, people, food are not. Consequently, according to Mamdani’s own reasoning, political identities should not be given much weight as the causes of genocide in Rwanda. It would have been much easier for the people to consciously will them away, rather than slaughter their neighbours or be slaughtered.

*When Victims Become Killers* is well worth reading. It provides a great deal of regional information on the Rwandan tragedy. It suffers, however, by confusing proximate causes with ultimate ones. It thus fails to provide a theoretical framework that can fruitfully integrate the economic, social, demographic, political and psychological elements that resulted in mass murder.

**PAUL J. MAGNARELLA**
*University of Florida*

---

*Christians and Chiefs in Zimbabwe: a social history of the Hwesa people c. 1870s–1990s* by **DAVID MAXWELL**

Historians, like scientists, readily divide into lumpers and splitters. Lumpers search for generalisations; splitters look for peculiarities. On the basis of this book David Maxwell must be adjudged a prince among splitters. He challenges every generalisation ever made about missions, conversions and religious change – and he backs up his challenges with convincing evidence. Readers who think they know everything there is to know about the political role of the Shona spirit medium or the relationship between religion and guerrilla warfare in the 1970s will be forced to reassess their positions. Like all true splitters, Maxwell makes no effort to substitute his own generalisations for the received wisdom.

Most historians who study missions can only guess at the motivations of early converts to Christianity by reading between the lines of documents penned by foreign missionaries. Maxwell has been able to do much more because intensive evangelisation of the Hwesa people of northeastern Zimbabwe only began after World War II. This enables him to compare mission records with the remembrances of living people who remember the coming of the missionaries. By paying close attention to the age, gender and status of converts, he is able to trace the process of conversion with unparalleled precision. His reading of all available sources on the Hwesa from the 1870s onwards gives him the understanding needed to interpret oral evidence.

Maxwell had the added advantage of studying two missions which stand at opposite poles of theology and politics. On one side were Pentecostals from Ulster who believed in direct communication from God and who took Satan,
evil spirits and witches seriously. On the other were Southern Irish Roman Catholics of the Carmelite order who looked to the Pope for guidance and classed Protestants among the heretics. Their rivalries made Central Africa a new battleground in the eternal Irish wars of religion. The main message of the book is that the fortunes of the churches were determined much more by the fluctuating interests of key elements in Hwesa society than by the beliefs or strategies of the missionaries. The advent of Christianity opened new possibilities for young men and women to challenge the ideological grounding of gerontocratic and patriarchal power. Unlike Ben Carton, whose Blood from your Children (Charlotte, VA: 2000) treats generational conflict as a constant, Maxwell is alert to processes which very gradually change young turks into old codgers. As the churches age, so too do the power structures within them. Yesterday’s scourge of chiefly power and superstition grows into today’s staunch supporter of traditional practice. Readers struggling to master the rather dry early chapters must press on if they want to know why the dissertation on which this book is based richly deserved the Audrey Richards Prize for the best African Studies thesis completed in the period 1994–96. The study springs vividly to life on page 151 when Maxwell recounts his meeting with Chief Njanji Katere in 1988. He had expected to meet a charismatic figure in splendid African garb, but instead found the pathetic figure of a decrepit old man in a badly kept homestead. ‘As I sat in the dust at his feet, clapping respect, he thanked me for coming to see him and complained that few others seemed to bother’ (pp. 151–2). The reason was that effective power had already passed to regents. All that changed when the old chief died a few months later. A fierce succession crisis ensued, in which claims to religious truth, history, hereditary power and even access to the unseen world were invoked to support the rights of rival factions. Maxwell’s moment had come. His unrivalled knowledge of official, ethnographic and missionary sources enabled him to chart the way tradition was manipulated and invented from day to day as the crisis unfolded. Every young scholar should read this account before doing fieldwork in Africa. It will act as a powerful antidote against the tendency to take oral tradition at face value, and will encourage a close reading of archival sources before visits to the travel agent. The excitement of the later sections of the book rivals the best novels. All in all, this is the most enjoyable book I have had the privilege of reviewing in the last five years.

NORMAN ETHERINGTON
University of Western Australia