

VU Research Portal

Review of John Drendel (ed.), *Crisis in the Later Middle Ages: Beyond the Postan-Duby paradigm*

Dauids, Karel

published in

Speculum
2017

DOI (link to publisher)

[10.1111/ehr.12510](https://doi.org/10.1111/ehr.12510)

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

document license

Article 25fa Dutch Copyright Act

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Dauids, K. (2017). Review of John Drendel (ed.), *Crisis in the Later Middle Ages: Beyond the Postan-Duby paradigm*. *Speculum*, 92 (3), 811-813. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ehr.12510>

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

honor required constant communication and negotiation. University members, then, needed to appear and behave in ways that enhanced the honor of the group. New students were immersed in a university *habitus* in order to properly manage behavior in ways that accorded with community identity and public perception. Chapter 4 focuses on the integration of the *béjaunes*—or freshmen—into university life, describing the rituals that marked the candidate’s movement from one stage to the next in an academic *cursus honorum*. These initiation rituals, which centered on the humiliation of the initiate, marked the *béjaune*’s transition from a rustic, uneducated “nobody” into a learned, honorable man. Chapter 5 describes the *cursus honorum* and its significance to the university’s self-image and reputation, as well as the role of exams and oaths in determining membership and cultivating loyalty to the community. Chapter 6 examines discourses of inclusion, namely the sermons and collations defining and celebrating the virtues the university claimed to embody. Chapter 7 turns to the significance of processions as a means of communicating the honorability that went along with academic rank. Chapter 8 rounds out this rich section, examining the role of memory in creating a common identity centered on honor.

Part 3 examines the ways in which competition and conflict shaped the expression and cultivation of honor, highlighting the tense relationship between the university and other powerful bodies as well as tensions internal to the community, particularly as individual scholars sought personal honor and became less invested in the collective. Chapter 9 demonstrates that attacks on university honor led to public demonstrations of the university’s dominance over social space and the demand for exemplary reparations. Of particular interest in this chapter is the author’s discussion of strikes as responses to attacks on university honor. Chapters 10 and 11 examine visual representations of scholars in manuscripts and seals, exposing tensions between representing the scholar as a “type” and representing the scholar as a distinct individual. Chapter 12 builds on the work of historians of gender, pointing to the importance of honor in expressions of masculinity.

The conclusion offers a chronological overview that the nonspecialist will find helpful, given the book’s thematic approach. Overall, Destemberg’s book is a thought-provoking and welcome addition to studies on the medieval university that adds considerably to our understanding of scholarly identity.

TANYA STABLER MILLER, Loyola University Chicago

JOHN DRENDEL, ed., *Crisis in the Later Middle Ages: Beyond the Postan-Duby Paradigm*. (The Medieval Countryside 13.) Turnhout: Brepols, 2015. Pp. xii, 368; 11 black-and-white figures and 23 tables. €90. ISBN: 978-2-503-54742-8. doi:10.1086/692445

The “Postan-Duby paradigm” is a shorthand term for a Malthusian interpretation of the crisis in the later Middle Ages proposed by Michael Postan and Georges Duby, which gained wide currency among economic historians in England and the European Continent from the early 1960s onwards. Postan was in fact slightly more Malthusian than Duby, as several authors in this volume point out. While Postan stressed the overriding importance of the tension between growing population pressure and the finiteness of agrarian resources, Duby was prepared to take account of the growth of trade and the role of towns as relevant (and to some extent alleviating) factors as well. Both authors agreed that an analysis of the relation between population and resources was key to understanding economic development in late medieval Europe.

The volume under review contains thirteen articles by English, French, Flemish, and Canadian historians that reflect on the state of the Postan-Duby paradigm at the turn of the twenty-first century and explore or suggest directions for new research. They do so in very

different ways. At one end of the spectrum we have historiographical essays on the debate about Postan's ideas in England by Richard Britnell and Philipp Schofield and on interpretations of the fourteenth-century crisis in Provence by Thierry Pécout. At the other end we find empirical case studies, solidly grounded in archival research, on the building industry and urban-rural relations in Provence by Philippe Bernardi, on new sources of prosperity in Languedoc before the outbreak of the plague by Monique Bourin, on labor conditions in fourteenth-century Marseille by Francine Michaud, on surveys of landed property in Roussillon in the 1290s by Laure Verdon, and on agriculture in female religious houses in northern France in the thirteenth century by Constance Berman. In between are three studies that focus on specific explanatory factors or actors that were underrated in the Postan-Duby paradigm, such as the role of small towns (by Christopher Dyer), technological innovation (by John Langdon), and the agency of peasants (by Anne Dewindt), plus two contributions that downplay the relevance of Malthusian model itself. John Munro stresses the far-reaching impact of monetary factors on economic development in England between about 1250 and 1500. Erik Thoen and Tim Soens demonstrate how the crisis in the late Middle Ages, owing to underlying differences in structures of production and social relations, played out in different regions in Flanders in different ways.

This volume has been long in the making. The papers were originally delivered at a meeting in Montreal in 2002, which was the first of a series of five conferences devoted to interpretations of economic developments in western and southern Europe in the late Middle Ages. Volumes with papers presented at later conferences in Rome and Madrid were already published a few years ago. Some authors have used the long interval between the Montreal conference and the publication to update the original papers, but not all of them seem to have done so, as far as one can infer from the bibliographies added to the individual contributions. The essays on France almost exclusively refer to books and articles published before 2002. For a reason left unexplained in the introduction, Langdon's contribution is the only one in this volume to contain an epilogue discussing developments in the debate in the decade after the Montreal conference took place.

All essays are informative and of high quality. Most of them make both appreciative and critical comments on the work by Postan or Duby, but the contributions that offer the most fundamental challenge to the paradigm are those by Erik Thoen and Tim Soens and the late John Munro. Thoen and Soens do so in an oblique way. They do not confront the Postan-Duby model directly (they do not even mention their work in their bibliography) but proceed to present a radically different interpretation inspired by Robert Brenner, Guy Bois, and Rodney Hilton—using a Marxian rather than a Malthusian framework, in fact. The article by John Munro stands out not only by its length (nearly sixty pages, almost three times as long as most of the other essays) but also by the impressive range of its argument and the massive amount of data on prices, wages, and mint output marshaled in support of it. It is the only essay in the book that attempts to overturn the Postan thesis head-on both by refuting his major claims and by redirecting the focus of the debate to the monetary sphere.

The brief introduction by John Drendel is slightly disappointing. Although it gives a useful summary of the context of the conference and the contents of the contributions, it fails to address two issues that to my mind are relevant for the subject of the volume. Drendel mentions "the discordance between the dearth of debate in France over ideas contested for decades in Britain" (5), but he does not discuss to what extent the conferences since 2002 have done anything to reduce this gap. Has a conceptual and methodological debate finally gotten off the ground in France, too, and if not, why not? The publication of the papers of the follow-up conferences should have allowed the editor to say more on this matter. Secondly, the introduction does not discuss more recent theoretical and methodological developments in the economic history of the late Middle Ages, such as the institutional approach

exemplified by Bas van Bavel's *Manors and Markets* (Oxford, 2010). Thus, this book is a very valuable collection of studies, but it is not entirely up to date.

KAREL DAVIDS, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, The Netherlands

OREN FALK, *The Bare-Sarked Warrior: A Brief Cultural History of Battlefield Exposure*. (Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies 451.) Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2015. Pp. vii, 168; 9 black-and-white figures. \$55. ISBN: 978-0-86698-502-4.
doi:10.1086/692252

In this innovative book, Oren Falk examines “a peculiar microhistory: the career of a literary configuration, whose stable form endures across centuries, continents, and cultures” (preface). Falk’s analysis emanates from the enigmatic episode involving Freydís Eiríksdóttir (daughter of Eiríkr the Red and sister to Leifr Eiríksson). *Eiríks saga rauða* and *Grœnlenðinga saga* (two texts that comprise the so-called *Vínland sagas*) describe an encounter between Norse explorers and *skrælingar*, a term with a disputed etymology used to describe the indigenous Native inhabitants of Newfoundland. When the Norse (under the leadership of Þorfinnr Karlsefni) are ambushed and attempt to flee, the pregnant Freydís pursues the *skrælingar*, wielding the sword of a fallen kinsman. Famously, Freydís then “drew [her] breast out from beneath [her] garment and slaps [*sic*] [it] with the bare sword,” a gesture meant to intimidate the *skrælingar* and incite the Norsemen to battle (*Eiríks saga*, cap. 11). Many scholars view this episode as an anomaly. Not so, argues Falk. Throughout his seven chapters, Falk artfully draws out the astonishing complexity of this moment alongside a variety of literary, iconographic, and linguistic traditions in an attempt to “recover a lost topos, a commonplace of the medieval (and . . . in certain respects also pre- and post-medieval) imagination” (2).

Falk assembles an impressive corpus of texts belonging to the topos, which he dubs the “bare-sarked warrior”—his etymological rationale deriving from **berr serkr* (or “shirtless”), a compound that Snorri Sturluson once put forward as the origin of *berserkr* (“berserk warrior”). For Falk, the core traits of this topos include displays of martial masculinity, defiance through the subversion of gendered expectations, and a woman who “bares her body” (8) in an effort to rally men to action. The Freydís legend becomes the adhesive for Falk’s study, which begins with a helpful overview of Norse voyages and settlements around Newfoundland (c. 1000). In his first two chapters, Falk searches for cognate scenes to “the Freydís anecdote.” Casting a wide net, he includes as one example a satirical printed image from revolution-era France (*Grand débandement de l’armée anticonstitutionnelle*) which depicts “a front line of women who bare their bottoms” against a troop of Jacobins. Each episode, Falk explains, features women “who successfully [rout] a far superior enemy” (24) through some form of bodily exposure. The comparisons are interesting, but a note on this page about lone women facing down powerful men in *Laxdœla saga* and *Gísla saga* (24 n. 9) left one wishing for a more extended discussion of Norse parallels. Falk also discusses the remarkable afterlife of the Freydís legend as seen in a seventeenth-century manuscript (AM 770b). Here, Freydís adopts an Amazonian persona by “[chopping] it [i.e., her breast] off, and [lobbing] it” after the *skrælingar*. This later embellishment is striking and, although Falk returns to it periodically, its underlying ferocity perhaps deserves more sustained attention here.

Falk’s fourth chapter explores Freydís’s connection to the *hvot* (or “whetting”) tradition. He explains how Freydís’s behavior falls under the rubric of a conventional *hvot*, which is “feminized by its presupposition that women may initiate, direct, or accelerate the play