Charting the Uncharted Waters: Non-Contractual Liabilities for Damage Caused by GNSS-Enabled Artificial Intelligence
Bratu, Ioana

2024

DOI (link to publisher)
10.5463/thesis.396

document version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link to publication in VU Research Portal

citation for published version (APA)

General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
• You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
• You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:
vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS .......................................................... 15
MAJOR SPACE TREATIES .................................................. 16
LEGISLATIVE PROPOSALS ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE .......... 17
RELEVANT PUBLICATIONS ............................................... 18

Chapter 1

INTRODUCTION ........................................................... 19
1.1 ALL WE NEED IS SPACE: UNDERSTANDING THE CRITICAL ROLE OF SATELLITE TECHNOLOGY .............................................. 19
1.2 WHEN NAVIGATION MEETS INTELLIGENCE: THE GNSS-POWERED AI REVOLUTION ...................................................... 21
1.3 LIABILITY IN TURBULENT SKIES: NAVIGATING THE CONSEQUENCES OF GNSS MALFUNCTIONS ........................................ 22
1.4 PURPOSE OF THE RESEARCH .......................................... 23
1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS .................................................. 24
1.6 WORKING SCENARIOS .................................................. 25
   Scenario 1 ...................................................................... 25
   Scenario 2 ...................................................................... 25
   Scenario 3 ...................................................................... 26
1.7 METHODOLOGY ............................................................ 27
1.8 LIMITATIONS AND INSIGHTS ......................................... 28
1.9 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS ........................................... 30

Chapter 2

DEMYSTIFYING ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE: OVERVIEW, APPLICATIONS, AND CAUSES OF MALFUNCTIONS ........................................... 31
2.1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................ 31
2.2 CHARTING A COURSE THROUGH DISRUPTION: THE BASICS OF ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE ........................................ 32
   2.2.1 A Brief History of Intelligent Machines ................................ 32
   2.2.2 Symbolic, Data-Driven and General Artificial Intelligence ....... 34
   2.2.3 From Earth to Space: Deploying Artificial Intelligence in Space-Related Activities .................................................. 36
2.3 FRAMING ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE VIA ITS UNIQUE CHARACTERISTICS ................................................................. 38
   2.3.1 Autonomy .................................................................. 39
   2.3.2 Learning Capacity ...................................................... 40
   2.3.3 Complexity and Interdependency .................................... 41
2.3.4 Opacity

2.4 ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE IN EUROPE: ENABLING TRUST FOR OUR DIGITAL LIVES VIA THE AI ACT

2.4.1 The European Approach to Defining “Artificial Intelligence”

2.4.2 The European Classification of Artificial Intelligence

2.4.2.1 Prohibited AI systems

2.4.2.2 High-risk AI systems

2.4.2.3 Limited and minimal risk AI systems

2.4.2.4 General-purpose AI

2.4.3 The Peculiar Case of GNSS-Enabled AI: Prohibited, High-Risk or Other Type of AI Systems?

2.5 SAILING THROUGH ROUGH WATERS: SOURCES OF ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE MALFUNCTIONS

2.5.1 Intentional and Unintentional Threats

2.5.2 The Role of GNSS in the Operation of AI Systems

2.6 CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 3
GLOBAL NAVIGATION SATELLITE SYSTEMS AS A TECHNOLOGICAL MARVEL: OVERVIEW, APPLICATIONS, AND CAUSES OF MALFUNCTIONS

3.1 INTRODUCTION

3.2 LIVING THE DREAM: AN INTRODUCTION TO GNSS CAPABILITIES

3.2.1 A Brief History of GNSS

3.2.2 Basic Technical Overview

3.2.2.1 GNSS segments

3.2.2.2 GNSS signals and service provision

3.3 EUROPE’S NAVIGATION REVOLUTION TAKES FLIGHT WITH GALILEO

3.3.1 Galileo Management Structure

3.3.2 Galileo Signals and Service Provision

3.4 SATELLITE-DRIVEN SYNERGY: EXAMPLES OF GNSS-ENABLED AI

3.4.1 Road Traffic

3.4.2 Aviation

3.4.3 Maritime Transport

3.4.4 Precision Agriculture

3.5 NAVIGATING THROUGH TROUBLE: SOURCES OF GNSS MALFUNCTIONS

3.5.1 Electronic Interferences

3.5.1.1 Intentional electronic interferences
3.5.1.2 Unintentional electronic interferences and other technical malfunctions

3.5.2 Kinetic Interferences

3.6 CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 4
AN ODYSSEY ENDEAVOR: DEFINING NON-CONTRACTUAL LIABILITY

4.1 INTRODUCTION

4.2 NAVIGATING THE TERMINOLOGICAL TRICHOTOMY: FROM ACCOUNTABILITY TO RESPONSIBILITY AND LIABILITY

4.3 FRAMING THE CONCEPT OF CIVIL LIABILITY

4.3.1 Contractual Versus Non-Contractual Liability

4.3.2 Legal Grounds of Non-Contractual Liability: Fault and Strict Liability Regimes

4.4 AN INVENTORY OF THE KEY ELEMENTS COMPOSING NON-CONTRACTUAL LIABILITY

4.4.1 Illegal Acts

4.4.2 Fault and Negligence

4.4.3 Damage

4.4.4 Causation

4.4.5 Compensation

4.5 THE ADVENT OF RISK-BASED NON-CONTRACTUAL LIABILITY

4.5.1 The Bright and the Dark Sides of Risk-Based Frameworks

4.5.2 Elements of Risk-Based Frameworks

4.6 CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 5
A LEGAL TURMOIL: DEFINING NON-CONTRACTUAL LIABILITY IN A GNSS CONTEXT

5.1 INTRODUCTION

5.2 EXPLORING THE CONUNDRUM OF GNSS GOVERNANCE

5.3 THE CHARTED WATERS: INITIAL APPROACHES TO GNSS LIABILITY

5.3.1 ICAO

5.3.2 UNIDROIT

5.4 UTOPIA MEETS REALITY: THE EUROPEAN APPROACH TO GNSS LIABILITY

5.4.1 European Proposals for GNSS Governance and Liability Presented Part of ICAO

5.4.2 The Absence of Clear GNSS Liability Provisions in the EU Policy
5.5 TOWARDS A WHITE WHALE QUEST: APPLYING THE INVENTORY OF LIABILITY IN A GNSS CONTEXT

5.5.1 Open Signals and Disclaimers of Liability

5.5.2 GNSS Cross-Border Damage

5.5.2.1 Damage occurring on the EU territory: applicable law

5.5.2.2 Damage occurring outside the EU territory: the problem of (foreign) state immunity and lessons learned from the United States

5.5.3 Multifaceted Causal Links

5.5.4 The Problem of “Many Hands” in a GNSS Context

5.6 CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 6
AN EVER-EVOLVING TERRAIN: THE LEGAL LANDSCAPE OF GNSS-RELATED DAMAGE IN INTERNATIONAL SPACE LAW

6.1 INTRODUCTION

6.2 THE PICTURE-PERFECT TRUTH: RELEVANCE OF CORPUS JURIS SPATIALIS FOR GNSS

6.3 A KAFKAESQUE MAZE: NAVIGATING LIABILITY UNDER CORPUS JURIS SPATIALIS

6.3.1 Provisions Representing Customary International Law

6.3.2 International Responsibility: An Alternative to International Liability?

6.3.3 A Dual Regime: Absolute and Fault-Based Liability for Third-Party Claims

6.4 A POSSIBLE STAIRWAY TO HEAVEN: APPLYING THE INVENTORY OF LIABILITY IN THE CONTEXT OF CORPUS JURIS SPATIALIS

6.4.1 GNSS Signals and the Notion of “Space Object”

6.4.1.1 Schools of thought related to the term “space object”

6.4.1.2 Observations on the component part

6.4.1.3 Interpretation rules for defining “space object”

6.4.1.4 Relevance of the term “launch”

6.4.1.5 Towards a new definition for “space object”

6.4.2 GNSS “Damage”

6.4.2.1 Schools of thought for interpreting the term “damage”

6.4.2.2 Interpretation rules for the definition of “damage”

6.4.3 The Link Between Space Objects and Damage: Causation

6.5 CONCLUSIONS
Chapter 7

THE UNCHARTED WATERS: EUROPEAN TORT LAW AND DAMAGE CAUSED BY GNSS-ENABLED AI

7.1 INTRODUCTION

7.2 THE EUROPEAN RISK-BASED APPROACH TO DAMAGE CAUSED BY GNSS-ENABLED AI

7.2.1 European Initiatives in the Field of AI Liability

7.2.2 The Commission’s Dual-Track Strategy: Fault and Strict Liability Regimes

7.3 A BRIDGE TO NOWHERE: APPLYING THE INVENTORY OF LIABILITY TO THE AI LIABILITY DIRECTIVE

7.3.1 Unclear Legal Status of GNSS-Enabled AI

7.3.2 Enabling Transparency via Disclosure of Evidence

7.3.3 A New Approach to Causation via Targeted Harmonization

7.3.3.1 Essential conditions leading to the presumption of causality

7.3.3.2 Types of claims

7.3.4 Conclusions on the Applicability of the AI Liability Directive to Damage Caused by GNSS-Enabled AI

7.4 A CLOUD WITH A SILVER LINING: APPLYING THE INVENTORY OF LIABILITY TO THE NEW PRODUCT LIABILITY DIRECTIVE

7.4.1 Tangibles Versus Intangibles and Their Defectiveness Under Directive 85/374

7.4.2 The Classification of GNSS-Enabled AI as “Products”: A Step into the Right Direction

7.4.3 A New Approach to Defectiveness and Development Risk Defence in Line with the Characteristics of AI Systems

7.4.4 A New Category of Actors Among the Existing “Many Hands”

7.4.5 Enabling Transparency via Disclosure of Evidence

7.4.6 Essential Conditions Leading to Presumptions of Defectiveness and Causality

Step 1. Proving defectiveness

Step 2. Assuming causality based on proven defectiveness

Step 3. The exception involving “excessive difficulties”

Step 4. Rebuttal

7.4.7 A Definition for “Damage” (Un)fit for the Digital Age

7.4.8 Conclusions on the Applicability of the New Product Liability Directive to Damage Caused by GNSS-Enabled AI

7.5 PROPOSALS FOR IMPROVING THE COMMISSION’S APPROACH TO AI LIABILITY
Chapter 8

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS 189

8.1 REVISITING THE RESEARCH AIM, QUESTIONS, AND METHODOLOGY 189

8.2 MAIN ARGUMENTS USED IN CONNECTION WITH THE RESEARCH AIM 191

What are AI systems? 191

What are GNSS and GNSS-enabled AI systems? 191

What is non-contractual liability? 192

What is non-contractual liability in a GNSS context? 192

How is international space law applicable to damage caused by GNSS-enabled AI at an upstream level? 194

How is EU non-contractual liability applicable to damage caused by GNSS-enabled AI at a downstream level? 195

8.3 FURTHER RESEARCH QUESTIONS 196

THESIS SUMMARY 199

BIBLIOGRAPHY 205