

VU Research Portal

Development as Meaning

van Winden, Sofia Christina

2024

DOI (link to publisher)
[10.5463/thesis.796](https://doi.org/10.5463/thesis.796)

document version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

van Winden, S. C. (2024). *Development as Meaning: A Religious Perspective on Sustainable Development Aspirations*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].
<https://doi.org/10.5463/thesis.796>

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:
vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Contents

Acknowledgements	1
Chapter 1: Introduction	5
1.1. Purpose of the dissertation	5
1.2. The starting point	6
1.3. Foundational positions	8
1.4. The SDGs, motivation and meaning	10
1.4.1. <i>Toward the SDGs</i>	10
1.4.2. <i>The progress made</i>	12
1.4.3. <i>Climate change and climate action</i>	13
1.4.4. <i>Critical views on (actions on) the SDGs</i>	14
1.4.5. <i>Means and ends, and being the change</i>	15
1.5. Actions and ethical foundations	17
1.5.1. <i>Consequentialism, deontology and virtue ethics</i>	17
1.5.2. <i>Making ethics meaningful</i>	20
1.5.3. <i>Meaning, the religious perspective and the modern ailment</i>	23
1.5.4. <i>The perspective applied</i>	25
1.6. Overview of content and research method	28
1.6.1. <i>The research question</i>	28
1.6.2. <i>Content of chapters and associated methods</i>	28
1.6.3. <i>Considerations and reservations</i>	32
1.7. Summary and concluding remarks	34
Chapter 2: The epistemological perspective	43
2.1. Religion in social scientific research	44
2.1.1. <i>Conceptions of religion</i>	45
2.2. The issue of construals and the religious perspective	52
2.3. A religiously-oriented epistemology	54
2.4. Pre-modern Western epistemology	58
2.4.1. <i>Ancient Greece: Socrates, Plato and Aristotle</i>	58
2.4.2. <i>Mediaeval epistemology</i>	60
2.5. Modern and postmodern epistemology	61
2.5.1. <i>Rationalist-empiricist epistemology</i>	61
2.5.2. <i>The age of science and the influence of positivism</i>	63
2.5.3. <i>Interpretivism, constructivism and the postmodern paradigm</i>	64
2.5.4. <i>Critical realism</i>	68
2.5.5. <i>Dialectical critical realism</i>	71
2.6. Toward a religious perspective?	72
2.6.1. <i>Impacts of epistemological shifts from a religious perspective</i>	72
2.6.2. <i>Alternative movements and calls for a revised epistemology</i>	74
2.6.3. <i>Applications</i>	84
2.7. Summary and concluding remarks	85
Chapter 3: The religious perspective	99
3.1. A multifaceted perspective	99
3.2. Meaning and the quest for fullness	103

3.2.1. <i>Religiously- and secularly-oriented conceptions</i>	103
3.2.2. <i>The flourishing issue</i>	107
3.3. The elusive beyond and the religious aspiration	112
3.3.1. <i>The esoteric and the exoteric – or the esoteric versus the exoteric</i>	114
3.4. Unity in diversity	119
3.5. Different revelations or deviations	124
3.5.1. <i>The ‘reliving’ requirement</i>	124
3.5.2. <i>‘Reliving’ applied? Western contemporary spirituality</i>	125
3.5.3. <i>Religious-secular demarcation lines</i>	129
3.6. Summary and concluding remarks	132
Chapter 4: The historical perspective	142
4.1. Premises for the narrative	144
4.1.1. <i>A secular Western world?</i>	144
4.1.2. <i>Factors and processes addressed</i>	145
4.2. Key shifts addressed	145
4.3. The narrative	150
4.3.1. <i>A multifaceted and complex Christian tradition</i>	150
4.3.2. <i>The ‘institutionalization’ of responsibility</i>	153
4.3.3. <i>Mediaeval change, the Reformation and social change</i>	155
4.3.4. <i>A merger of dimensions and the emergence of exclusive humanism</i>	158
4.4. The beyond and this world	162
4.5. Summary and concluding remarks	165
Chapter 5: The developmental perspective	172
5.1. Development ideas and theories	174
5.1.1. <i>Undefined, contentious, persistent</i>	174
5.1.2. <i>The first discourse</i>	178
5.1.3. <i>The second discourse</i>	182
5.1.4. <i>The third discourse</i>	189
5.2. The concept of well-being and the capability approach	191
5.2.1. <i>Well-being and (conceptualizations of) prosperity</i>	191
5.2.2. <i>The capability approach</i>	194
5.3. Challenges and potential alternative perspectives	197
5.3.1. <i>Defining functionings</i>	197
5.3.2. <i>The individual, freedom and responsibility</i>	200
5.3.3. <i>Redefining well-being?</i>	204
5.3.4. <i>Well-being, flourishing and freedom from a religious perspective</i>	207
5.3.5. <i>The free society</i>	212
5.4. Religion in a contemporary development context	214
5.5. Summary and concluding remarks	222
Chapter 6: The sustainability perspective	239
6.1. Sustainability and sustainable development: foundational perspectives	241
6.1.1. <i>Anthropocentric, resource-based and economic perspectives</i>	241
6.2. Alternative foundations	249
6.2.1. <i>Biocentric and ecocentric perspectives</i>	249
6.2.2. <i>Frameworks and (non-)dualist foundations</i>	253
6.2.3. <i>Transcending distinctions and the religious perspective</i>	255

6.3. Religion in sustainability aspirations	256
6.3.1. <i>The Earth Charter and religious ecological ethics</i>	256
6.3.2. <i>Religion and ecology (or religious ecology)</i>	259
6.3.3. <i>Religion, environmentalism and ‘sustainability assessments’</i>	261
6.4. Summary and concluding remarks	268
Chapter 7: The UN Sustainable Development Agenda	282
7.1. A journey or an end state, and transformation versus reaffirmation	284
7.2. Predominant codes	286
7.2.1. <i>Foundation</i>	286
7.2.2. <i>Overarching principles</i>	287
7.2.3. <i>Values and (or as) end states</i>	288
7.2.4. <i>Actors</i>	289
7.3. References to spirituality and religion	292
7.4. Post-2015	294
7.5. Summary and concluding remarks	296
Chapter 8: Interviews: summary and analysis	304
8.1. Method	304
8.1.1. <i>Respondents</i>	304
8.1.2. <i>Implementation and associated considerations</i>	306
8.1.3. <i>Analysis</i>	309
8.2. Interview results	310
8.2.1. <i>Key concerns and the SDGs</i>	310
8.2.2. <i>Articulations of the religious aspiration and its application</i>	314
8.2.3. <i>Means as end</i>	321
8.2.4. <i>Unity in diversity and religious-secular demarcation lines</i>	323
8.2.5. <i>Challenges</i>	326
8.3. Summary and concluding remarks	330
Chapter 9: Key findings and conclusions	341
9.1. Development agendas and the action-oriented perspective	343
9.2. Associated frameworks and suggested alternatives	346
9.3. Dualist and non-dualist foundations	347
9.4. Realizing non-dualism: the religious aspiration	349
9.5. The need for self-reflection applied onto religion	351
9.6. The religious perspective and sustainable development aspirations	352
9.7. The ‘instrumentalization’ issue	356
9.8. Applying a religious perspective	358
9.9. The epistemological issue revisited	360
9.10. Further research	362
9.11. Final remarks	364
Bibliography	368
Appendix 1: Introduction to the interviews	395
Appendix 2: Interview guides	398
Summary	400