

## VU Research Portal

### **The Eschatological Meaning of Jesus' Resurrection as a Historical Event: A Comparison of the Views of Wolfhart Pannenberg and N.T. Wright**

Bang, S.S.

2014

#### **document version**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

#### **citation for published version (APA)**

Bang, S. S. (2014). *The Eschatological Meaning of Jesus' Resurrection as a Historical Event: A Comparison of the Views of Wolfhart Pannenberg and N.T. Wright*.

#### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

#### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

#### **E-mail address:**

[vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl](mailto:vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl)

# Contents

<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	v
<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
A. Research Questions .....	3
B. Justification for This Study .....	5
C. Outline of the Work .....	6
<b>Part I Can Jesus' Resurrection be Proven to be a Historical Event?</b>	
<b>Introduction</b> .....	9
A. The Post-Enlightenment Position of No Compatibility .....	9
1. No Historical Event! No True Religion! .....	10
2. A Historical Event beyond Historical Verification .....	11
3. Not a Historical Event, but not a Problem! .....	15
<b>Chapter One: Belief in Jesus' Resurrection Is Compatible with Historical Reality</b>	
A. Wolfhart Pannenberg: Faith and Reason Must Be Compatible .....	19
1. The Ontological Concept of the Reality of Jesus' Resurrection .....	21
1) Reality ( <i>Wirklichkeit</i> ) as a Whole .....	21
2) Reality as History .....	24
3) Reality in the Form of Anticipation .....	26
4) The Ontological Priority of the Future .....	28
2. History as the Ground of Faith .....	29
1) Event: Not as Decision by Faith but as Transforming Power .....	31
2) Jesus' Resurrection as an Event, not Merely a Matter of Faith .....	32
3. One General History: Not Separation between <i>Heilsgeschichte</i> and History .....	35
1) Pannenberg's Critique of Barth's and Bultmann's Abandonment of History ...	35
2) Revelation as the Indirect Disclosure of God in History .....	37
3) The Bible Proves the Existence of One Linear History .....	40
4) The Apocalyptic Understanding of History .....	43
4. The Modern Atheistic and Anthropocentric View of the Resurrection .....	45
1) Ernst Troeltsch's Principle of Analogy .....	45
2) The Modern Scientific and Atheistic View of Reality .....	48
3) Natural Law and Jesus' Resurrection as Miracle .....	50
B. N.T. Wright: Critical Realism as the Methodology of Jesus' Resurrection .....	55
1. Wright's Critique of Negative Reasons .....	56
1) There is No Access: the Phenomenological view of Willi Marxen .....	56
2) There is No Analogy: the Empirical Methodology of Ernst Troeltsch .....	58
3) There is No Evidence: Rudolf Bultmann, Gerd Lüdemann, and J.N.D. Crossan...59	

4) The Resurrection as the Epistemological Ground of Christian Faith: Hans Frei ..	61
5) Resurrection and Christology .....	61
6) Resurrection and Eschatology .....	63
2. The Methodological Application of the Critical Realistic View of Jesus’ Resurrection .....	65
1) Integration of History and Theology .....	67
2) Examining Worldviews in terms of Stories, Symbols, Praxis, and Questions ...	69
Summary .....	70

## **Chapter Two: The Nature of Jesus’ Resurrected Body**

A. Pannenberg: The Corporeality of the Resurrected body as Evidence .....	73
1. Metaphorical Meaning and the Corporeality of the Resurrected Body of Jesus ..	73
1) The Anthropological Concept of Resurrection: <i>Weltoffenheit, Umweltfreiheit,</i> and Hope beyond Death .....	75
2) The Theological Concept of Resurrected Body: <i>Soma Pneumatikon</i> .....	76
2. Two Independent Types of Easter Stories: The Appearances and the Empty Tomb ..	79
1) The Relationship between the Two Types of Stories .....	80
2) Jesus’ Resurrection and the Emergence of Primitive Christianity .....	82
3) The Reality of Jesus’ Appearances .....	83
B. N.T. Wright: Resurrection as the Re-embodiment of the Dead .....	85
1. No Possibility of Resurrection: Life beyond Death in the Pagan World .....	86
2. The Hope of Resurrection based on the Faithfulness of God, the Creator .....	87
3. The Metaphor of the Bodily Resurrection as the Restoration of Israel .....	90
4. Resurrection in the Early Church .....	92
1) Two Dependent Easter Traditions .....	95
2) The Origins of the Early Church .....	95
Summary .....	97

## **Chapter Three: Conclusions**

A. Suggestions for the Compatibility between Faith and Reason .....	99
B. A Successful model for Applying Critical Realism to Jesus’ Resurrection .....	104
C. Refocusing on the Corporeality in the Two Types of Easter Stories .....	106
D. Overcoming Dualism by Positing One General History .....	108
E. Wright’s Critique of Pannenberg’s Eschatological Realism .....	110

## **Part II. Theological Implications of Jesus’ Resurrection as a Historical Event**

<b>Introduction</b> .....	117
A. Types of Modern Eschatology .....	117
1. The De-Eschatologization of the Kingdom of God in Modern Liberalism .....	118
2. The <i>Thoroughgoing (Consequent)</i> Eschatology .....	120

3. The Realized Eschatology of C.H. Dodd .....	123
4. Transcendental Eschatology .....	125
5. The Emphasis on the Relationship between the Present and Future Kingdom of God .....	129

**Chapter Four: The Role of the Resurrection within the N.T. Idea of Salvation**

A. Pannenberg: God’s Self-Disclosure Affirmed by Jesus’ Resurrection .....	133
1. The Resurrection of Jesus as the <i>Proleptic</i> Realization of the End .....	133
2. Jesus’ Resurrection Affirms the Divinity of Jesus.....	136
1) The Messiahship and Sonship of Jesus .....	136
2) The Spirit and the Resurrection .....	139
3) The Presence of Salvation in the Light of Resurrection .....	140
3. God’s Self-Disclosure in Jesus Christ .....	142
B. N.T. Wright: The Resurrection as the Climax of Israel’s History .....	147
1. The Final Return from Exile through Jesus in Early Christian Belief .....	148
2. The Coming of the Kingdom of God .....	151
3. The Resurrection and Apocalyptic Expectation of the End of the World .....	153
1) The Misunderstanding of the Apocalyptic End of the World .....	155
2) The Meaning of <i>Parousia</i> for the Early Christians .....	159
4. The Crucified One is the True Messiah .....	162
1) The Messiah as Israel’s Representative .....	163
2) Jesus, the Representative of True Humanity .....	165
3) Messiahship, the Kingdom, and the Temple .....	169
4) The Resurrection affirms Jesus’ Messiahship .....	171
5. Jesus’ Divinity and the Jewish Monotheistic God .....	173
Summary .....	176

**Chapter Five: The Nature of the Realized Kingdom of God**

A. Pannenberg: The Unity of the Kingdom of Jesus’ Lordship and the Kingdom of God the Father .....	179
1. The Kingdom of Jesus’ Lordship .....	181
2. Time and Eternity .....	183
3. The Church as the Precursor of the Kingdom of God .....	185
B. N.T. Wright: The Kingdom of God Calling the True People of God .....	187
1. The Kingdom of God as the Language of Kingship .....	187
2. Inaugurated Eschatology and <i>Cooperative Eschatology</i> .....	190
1) The Meaning of Inaugurated Eschatology .....	191
2) New Ethics and the New Israel .....	194
Summary .....	197

## **Chapter Six: Our Eschatological Hope Affirmed by the Historicity of Jesus' Resurrection**

A. Pannenberg: The End of History as Unfolded in the Resurrection of Jesus Christ .....	199
1. The Apocalyptic Hope of the End .....	200
2. Human Destiny as Revealed in Jesus' Resurrection .....	201
3. The <i>Parousia</i> and the Completion of the Kingdom of God .....	203
B. N.T. Wright: Cosmic Transformation as the Nature of Eschatological Hope ....	207
1. The Resurrection and the New Creation .....	207
1) The Resurrection as the Reaffirmation of God's Good Creation ....	209
2) Jesus' Resurrection as Victory over Death .....	211
3) Easter Day as the First Day of New Creation Accomplished by the Holy Spirit .....	213
4) The Holy Spirit as the Guarantor of Universal Resurrection .....	215
2. The Nature of Hope .....	217
1) Cosmic Transformation as We Await .....	218
2) <i>Life after Life after Death</i> within the Transformed Body .....	219
3. The <i>Parousia</i> as Jesus' Second Coming and Transformation .....	221
Summary .....	223

## **Chapter Seven: Remaining Theological Issues**

A. Jesus' Resurrection as the Core Issue with Respect to the Realized Kingdom of God .....	227
B. Jesus' Resurrection as a Historical Confirmation of Jesus' Divinity .....	229
C. The <i>Parousia</i> as the Coming of God in the Tension between <i>Already</i> and <i>Not Yet</i> .....	230
D. Not Doomsday but Apocalyptic Eschatology as the Nature of Hope .....	234
E. Christian Ethics Subordinated in the Kingdom of God under Jesus' Lordship .....	237
F. The Transformation of the World as the Goal of History .....	241

<b>Recapitulation</b> .....	245
-----------------------------	-----

<b>Summary</b> .....	249
----------------------	-----

<b>Samenvatting</b> .....	255
---------------------------	-----

<b>Bibliography</b> .....	261
---------------------------	-----

<b>Curriculum Vitae</b> .....	277
-------------------------------	-----