

VU Research Portal

Bolzano's Notion of Grounding and the Classical Model of Science

Roski, S.P.

2014

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Roski, S. P. (2014). *Bolzano's Notion of Grounding and the Classical Model of Science*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Acknowledgements	ix
1 Introduction	1
1.1 The Classical Model of Science and the notion of explanation in axiomatics	3
1.2 Grounding – the general idea	6
1.2.1 Three cases	6
1.2.2 Six claims	13
1.3 Overview of the literature	15
1.4 What I will not do in this thesis	17
1.5 Principles of interpretation	18
1.6 Overview of the thesis	19
2 The <i>Beyträge</i>: Bolzano’s early views on grounding	25
2.1 Introduction	25
2.2 Preparations	29
2.2.1 Scope and historical context of the <i>Beyträge</i>	29
2.2.2 Scientific presentation and scientific proofs	31
2.2.3 The logic of the <i>Beyträge</i>	34
2.3 Ways of being objectively dependent and criteria of axiomhood	45
2.3.1 In search for an objective notion of axiomhood	46
2.3.2 A set of rules	48
2.3.3 Other rules?	54
2.3.4 A necessary condition for axiomhood	56
2.4 Desiderata for presentations and proofs	61
2.4.1 (D1) & (D2): Simplicity and generality	62
2.4.1.1 (D2): The Complexity Constraint in the BD	63

	2.4.1.2	(D1): The Generality Constraint in the BD . . .	65
	2.4.2	(D3): Relevance, redundancy and the fallacy of kind-crossing	68
	2.4.3	(D4): Uniqueness	73
	2.4.4	Wrapping up	78
2.5		The <i>Beyträge</i> 's conception of science	79
2.6		Conclusion	83
2.7		(Appendix) Varieties of dependence: Bolzano's <i>Aetiologie</i>	84
	2.7.1	Some examples	85
	2.7.2	Axioms of <i>Aetiologie</i>	87
	2.7.3	<i>Aetiologie</i> and explanatory dependence	88
3		Objective truth, variation, truth-preservation	91
3.1		Introduction	91
3.2		The basic framework of the WL	93
	3.2.1	Propositions and ideas	94
	3.2.2	Concepts and intuitions	98
	3.2.3	Form and truth	101
3.3		The logic of variation	110
	3.3.1	Remarks on collections and notation	110
	3.3.2	The definition of a variant	112
	3.3.3	Analyticity in the WL	115
	3.3.4	Deducibility	119
		3.3.4.1 Basic properties of deducibility	122
		3.3.4.2 Logical deducibility	123
		3.3.4.3 Equivalence	124
	3.3.5	Exact deducibility	125
3.4		Conclusion	130
4		Explanatory priority: Bolzano's pure logic of grounding	133
4.1		Introduction	133
4.2		Preliminaries	135
	4.2.1	Existing reconstructions of Bolzano's theory	136
	4.2.2	A remark on Bolzano's method of clarification	137
	4.2.3	Grounding, deducibility and causality	138
4.3		Some basic distinctions	140
4.4		Immediate grounding	146
	4.4.1	Irreflexivity, Aristotle's insight and uniqueness	146
	4.4.2	Interlude: a stronger uniqueness requirement	153
	4.4.3	Further properties of immediate grounding	159
4.5		A more concise reconstruction	174
4.6		Mediate grounding	179
	4.6.1	"Ascending from consequences to their grounds"	179

4.6.2	Properties of mediate grounding	184
4.6.3	(Appendix) Infinite grounding trees	186
5	Simplicity and economy: Bolzano's impure logic of grounding	191
5.1	Introduction	191
5.2	Conceptuality, complexity and the existence of fundamental truths	195
5.2.1	Conceptuality and complexity: WL, §221.1 & §221.2	196
5.2.2	There are fundamental (conceptual) truths: WL, §221.3	201
5.2.3	A different notion of complexity and the ideal of purity	204
5.3	Economy Principles	212
5.3.1	Grounding and deducibility	214
5.3.2	Propositional economy: WL, §221.5	222
5.3.3	Partial grounds are logically independent and not logically analytic	231
5.3.4	Conceptual economy: WL, §221.4	237
5.3.5	A tension in Bolzano's theory of grounding	241
5.3.5.1	The tension explained	241
5.3.5.2	Prospects for resolving the tension	244
5.3.5.3	Wrapping up	247
5.3.6	Global economy: WL, §221.3	248
5.3.7	A principle for sciences?	260
5.4	The Generality Constraint: WL, §221.6	262
5.4.1	A traditional principle rejected	263
5.4.2	An alternative principle	266
5.4.3	A proposal for an interpretation	268
5.5	Jointly sufficient conditions for grounding: WL, §221.7	273
5.5.1	The main idea	274
5.5.2	Interpretation of (N ₁)–(N ₃)	276
5.5.3	Another attempt	279
5.5.4	Sufficient, but also necessary?	281
5.5.5	Grounding preserved under variation	283
5.6	Bolzano's tentative definition of grounding: WL, §221.note	287
5.6.1	Introduction	287
5.6.2	Interpretation of (DfG)	289
5.6.3	Retaining local grounding	293
5.7	Fundamental truths revisited	295
5.8	Conclusion	302
6	The WL's conception of science	307
6.1	Introduction	307
6.2	Recapitulating the BD	311
6.3	Sciences and their starting points	312

6.3.1	Sciences as collections of truths	313
6.3.2	<i>Grundsätze</i> of a science	315
6.3.2.1	<i>Grundsätze</i> _{WL} vs. <i>Grundsätze</i> _{BD} I: Groundedness	319
6.3.2.2	<i>Grundsätze</i> _{WL} vs. <i>Grundsätze</i> _{BD} II: Remoteness .	322
6.3.2.3	<i>Grundsätze</i> _{WL} vs. <i>Grundsätze</i> _{BD} III: Complexity	324
6.3.3	An illustration: geometry and the definition of the notion of location	325
6.3.4	Concluding remarks and the CMS	328
6.4	Domain and demarcation of sciences	329
6.4.1	The concept of a suitable science	331
6.4.2	Hope for an objective criterion?	335
6.4.3	The hierarchy of sciences in the WL	337
6.5	The Presentation of a Science	340
6.5.1	Epistemological prelude	341
6.5.2	The main purpose of a scientific treatise	343
6.5.3	Proofs in rigorous scientific presentations	350
6.5.3.1	The general notion of proof	350
6.5.3.2	Demonstrations	355
6.5.3.3	Definitions and deductions	363
6.6	Conclusion	365
7	Conclusion	367
A	Immediate predecessor	375
B	Conceptions of Science	379
C	Summary in Dutch: Bolzano's notie van fundering en het Klassiek Model van Wetenschap	383
	List of abbreviations	389
	Bibliography	391