

VU Research Portal

Making sense of haptics

van Beek, F.E.

2016

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

van Beek, F. E. (2016). *Making sense of haptics: fundamentals of haptic perception and their implications for haptic device design*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

References

- Abbink, D. A., Mulder, M., & Boer, E. R. (2012). Haptic shared control: smoothly shifting control authority? *Cognition, Technology & Work*, *14*(1), 19–28.
- Abravanel, E. (1971). The synthesis of length within and between perceptual systems. *Perception & Psychophysics*, *9*(4), 327–328.
- Adamovich, S. V., Berkinblit, M. B., Fookson, O., & Poizner, H. (1998). Pointing in 3D space to remembered targets. I. Kinesthetic versus visual target presentation. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, *79*(6), 2833–2846.
- Ahmed, A. A., Wolpert, D. M., & Flanagan, J. R. (2008). Flexible representations of dynamics are used in object manipulation. *Current Biology*, *18*(10), 763–768.
- Armstrong, L. & Marks, L. (1999). Haptic perception of linear extent. *Perception & Psychophysics*, *61*(6), 1211–1226.
- Artemiadis, P., Katsiaris, P., Liarokapis, M., & Kyriakopoulos, K. (2010). Human arm impedance: characterization and modeling in 3D space. In *International Conference on Intelligent Robots and Systems* (pp. 3103–3108).
- Artemiadis, P., Katsiaris, P., Liarokapis, M., & Kyriakopoulos, K. (2011). On the effect of human arm manipulability in 3D force tasks: towards force-controlled exoskeletons. In *IEEE International Conference on Robotics and Automation* (pp. 3784–3789).
- Ashby, A., Shea, C., & Howard, R. M. (1980). Short term memory for kinesthetic movement information: influence of location cues on recall of distance. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, *51*, 403–406.
- Barbagli, F., Salisbury, K., Ho, C., Spence, C., & Tan, H. Z. (2006). Haptic discrimination of force direction and the influence of visual information. *ACM Transactions on Applied Perception*, *3*(2), 125–135.
- Baud-Bovy, G. & Gatti, E. (2010). Hand-held object force direction identification thresholds at rest and during movement. In A. M. L. Kappers, J. B. F. Van Erp, W. M. Bergmann Tiest, & F. C. T. Van der Helm (Eds.), *Haptics: generating and perceiving*

-
- tangible sensations* (Vol. 6192, pp. 231–236). Lecture Notes in Computer Science. Springer Berlin/Heidelberg.
- Baud-Bovy, G. (2014). The perception of the centre of elastic force fields: a model of integration of the force and position signals. In M. Di Luca (Ed.), *Multisensory softness* (Chap. 7, pp. 127–146). Springer Series on Touch and Haptic Systems. Springer London.
- Bergmann Tiest, W. M., van der Hoff, L. M. A., & Kappers, A. M. L. (2011). Cutaneous and kinaesthetic perception of traversed distance. In *Proceedings of the IEEE World Haptics Conference* (pp. 593–597).
- Bergmann Tiest, W. M. (2010). Tactual perception of material properties. *Vision Research*, 50(24), 2775–2782.
- Bergmann Tiest, W. M. & Kappers, A. M. L. (2009). Cues for haptic perception of compliance. *IEEE Transactions on Haptics*, 2(4), 189–199.
- Bergmann Tiest, W. M. & Kappers, A. M. L. (2014). Physical aspects of softness perception. In M. Di Luca (Ed.), *Multisensory softness* (pp. 3–15). London: Springer-Verlag.
- Bicchi, A., Melchiorri, C., & Balluchi, D. (1995). On the mobility and manipulability of general multiple limb robots. *IEEE Transactions on Robotics and Automation*, 11(2), 215–228.
- Blair, G. W. S. & Coppen, F. M. V. (1939). The subjective judgment of the elastic and plastic properties of soft bodies; the "differential thresholds" for viscosities and compression moduli. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences*, 128(850), 109–125.
- Bocca, F. & Baud-Bovy, G. (2009). A model of perception of the central point of elastic force fields. In *Proceedings of the 3rd Joint World Haptics Conference and Symposium on Haptic Interfaces for Virtual Environment and Teleoperator Systems (WHC)* (pp. 576–581). Salt Lake City, UT, USA.
- Brodie, E. E. & Ross, H. E. (1984). Sensorimotor mechanisms in weight discrimination. *Attention, Perception & Psychophysics*, 36(5), 477–481.
- Brodie, E. E. & Ross, H. E. (1985). Jiggling a lifted weight does aid discrimination. *The American Journal of Psychology*, 98(3), 469–471.
- Burdet, E., Osu, R., Franklin, D. W., Milner, T. E., & Kawato, M. (2001). The central nervous system stabilizes unstable dynamics by learning optimal impedance. *Nature*, 414(6862), 446–449.
- Coppen, F. (1942). The differential threshold for the subjective judgement of the elastic and plastic properties of soft bodies. *British Journal of Psychology. General Section*, 32(3), 231–247.
- Coren, S. (1993). *The left-hander syndrome*. Vintage Books, New York.

- Cos, I., Duque, J., & Cisek, P. (2014). Rapid prediction of biomechanical costs during action decisions. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, *112*(6), 1256–1266.
- Crevecoeur, F. & Scott, S. H. (2014). Beyond muscles stiffness: importance of state-estimation to account for very fast motor corrections. *PLoS Computational Biology*, *10*(10), e1003869.
- Darainy, M., Malfait, N., Gribble, P. L., Towhidkhah, F., & Ostry, D. J. (2004). Learning to control arm stiffness under static conditions. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, *92*(6), 3344–3350.
- Darainy, M., Towhidkhah, F., & Ostry, D. J. (2007). Control of hand impedance under static conditions and during reaching movement. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, *97*(4), 2676–2685.
- Davidon, R. S. & Cheng, M.-F. H. (1964). Apparent distance in a horizontal plane with tactile-kinesthetic stimuli. *Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology*, *16*(3), 277–281.
- Day, R. H. & Avery, G. C. (1970). Absence of the horizontal-vertical illusion in haptic space. *Journal of Experimental Psychology*, *83*(1), 172–173.
- De Jonge, A., Wildenbeest, J., Boessenkool, H., & Abbink, D. (In press). The effect of trial-by-trial adaptation on conflicts in haptic shared control for free-air teleoperation tasks. *IEEE Transactions on Haptics*.
- De Santis, D., Zenzeri, J., Masia, L., Squeri, V., & Morasso, P. (2014). Exploiting the link between action and perception: minimally assisted robotic training of the kinesthetic sense. In *5th IEEE RAS EMBS International Conference on Biomedical Robotics and Biomechatronics* (pp. 287–292).
- De Vlugt, E., Schouten, A. C., & van der Helm, F. C. T. (2003). Closed-loop multivariable system identification for the characterization of the dynamic arm compliance using continuous force disturbances: a model study. *Journal of Neuroscience Methods*, *122*(2), 123–140.
- De Vlugt, E., Schouten, A. C., & van der Helm, F. C. T. (2006). Quantification of intrinsic and reflexive properties during multijoint arm posture. *Journal of Neuroscience Methods*, *155*(2), 328–349.
- Deregowski, J. & Ellis, H. (1972). Effect of stimulus orientation upon haptic perception of the horizontal-vertical illusion. *Journal of Experimental Psychology*, *95*(1), 14–19.
- Dolan, J., Friedman, M., & Nagurka, M. (1993). Dynamic and loaded impedance components in the maintenance of human arm posture. *IEEE Transactions on Systems, Man and Cybernetics*, *23*(3), 698–709.
- Dopjans, L., Bülthoff, H. H., & Wallraven, C. (2012). Serial exploration of faces: comparing vision and touch. *Journal of Vision*, *12*(1:6), 1–14.

-
- Dorjgotov, E., Bertoline, G., Arns, L., Pizlo, Z., & Dunlop, S. (2008). Force amplitude perception in six orthogonal directions. In *Proceedings of the Symposium on Haptics Interfaces for Virtual Environment and Teleoperator Systems* (pp. 121–127).
- Drewing, K. & Ernst, M. O. (2006). Integration of force and position cues for shape perception through active touch. *Brain Research*, *1078*(1), 92–100.
- Durlach, N., Delhorne, L., Wong, A., Ko, W., Rabinowitz, W., & Hollerbach, J. (1989). Manual discrimination and identification of length by the finger-span method. *Perception & Psychophysics*, *46*(1), 29–38.
- Elhajj, I., Weerasinghe, H., Dika, A., & Hansen, R. (2006). Human perception of haptic force direction. In *Proceedings of the IEEE/RSJ International Conference on Intelligent Robots and Systems* (pp. 989–993).
- Ernst, M. O. & Banks, M. S. (2002). Humans integrate visual and haptic information in a statistically optimal fashion. *Nature*, *415*(6870), 429–433.
- Ernst, M. O. & Bühlhoff, H. H. (2004). Merging the senses into a robust percept. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, *8*(4), 162–169.
- Faineteau, H., Gentaz, E., & Viviani, P. (2003). The kinaesthetic perception of Euclidean distance: a study of the detour effect. *Experimental Brain Research*, *152*(2), 166–172.
- Fasse, E. D., Hogan, N., Kay, B. A., & Mussa-Ivaldi, F. A. (2000). Haptic interaction with virtual objects. *Biological Cybernetics*, *82*(1), 69–83.
- Flash, T. & Mussa-Ivaldi, F. (1990). Human arm stiffness characteristics during the maintenance of posture. *Experimental Brain Research*, *82*(2), 315–326.
- Forbes, P. A., Happee, R., van der Helm, F. C. T., & Schouten, A. C. (2011). EMG feedback tasks reduce reflexive stiffness during force and position perturbations. *Experimental Brain Research*, *213*(1), 49–61.
- Franklin, D., Burdet, E., Osu, R., Kawato, M., & Milner, T. (2003). Functional significance of stiffness in adaptation of multijoint arm movements to stable and unstable dynamics. *Experimental Brain Research*, *151*(2), 145–157.
- Fuentes, C. T. & Bastian, A. J. (2010). Where is your arm? Variations in proprioception across space and tasks. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, *103*(1), 164–171.
- Gandevia, S. & McCloskey, D. (1976). Perceived heaviness of lifted objects and effects of sensory inputs from related, non-lifting parts. *Brain Research*, *109*(2), 399–401.
- Gandevia, S. & McCloskey, D. (1977). Sensations of heaviness. *Brain*, *100*(2), 345–354.
- Gaydos, H. F. (1958). Sensitivity in the judgment of size by finger-span. *The American Journal of Psychology*, *71*(3), 557–562.
- Gentaz, E. & Hatwell, Y. (2004). Geometrical haptic illusions: the role of exploration in the Müller-Lyer, vertical-horizontal, and Delboeuf illusions. *Psychonomic Bulletin & Review*, *11*(1), 31–40.

- Gentaz, E. & Hatwell, Y. (2008). Haptic perceptual illusions. In M. Grunwald (Ed.), *Human haptic perception: basics and applications* (pp. 223–233). Birkhäuser Basel.
- Gomi, H. & Kawato, M. (1997). Human arm stiffness and equilibrium-point trajectory during multi-joint movement. *Biological Cybernetics*, 76(3), 163–171.
- Gupta, R. K., Gupta, M., & Kool, V. K. (1986). Role of vision and kinesthesia in location and distance estimates. *Acta Psychologica*, 62(2), 141–159.
- Gurari, N. & Baud-Bovy, G. (2014). Customization, control, and characterization of a commercial haptic device for high-fidelity rendering of weak forces. *Journal of Neuroscience Methods*, 235, 169–180.
- Haggard, P., Newen, C., Blundell, J., & Andrew, H. (2000). The perceived position of the hand in space. *Perception & Psychophysics*, 62(2), 363–377.
- Hale, K. S. & Stanney, K. M. (2004). Deriving haptic design guidelines from human physiological, psychophysical, and neurological foundations. *IEEE Computer Graphics and Applications*, 24, 33–39.
- Han, G. & Choi, S. (2010). Extended rate-hardness: a measure for perceived hardness. In A. M. L. Kappers, J. B. F. van Erp, W. M. Bergmann Tiest, & F. C. T. van der Helm (Eds.), *Haptics: generating and perceiving tangible sensations* (Vol. 6191, pp. 117–124). Lecture Notes in Computer Science. Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Harper, R. & Stevens, S. S. (1964). Subjective hardness of compliant materials. *Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 16(3), 204–215.
- Hayward, V., Astley, O. R., Cruz-Hernandez, M., Grant, D., & Robles-De-La-Torre, G. (2004). Haptic interfaces and devices. *Sensor Review*, 24(1), 16–29.
- Heck, D., Saccon, A., & Nijmeijer, H. (submitted). *Direct force-reflecting two-layer approach for stable bilateral teleoperation with time delays*.
- Heit, E. (2000). Properties of inductive reasoning. *Psychonomic Bulletin & Review*, 7(4), 569–592.
- Helms Tillery, S. I., Flanders, M., & Soechting, J. F. (1994). Errors in kinesthetic transformations for hand apposition. *Neuroreport*, 6(1), 177–181.
- Hermelin, B. & O'Connor, N. (1975). Location and distance estimates by blind and sighted children. *Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 27(2), 295–301.
- Heuer, H. & Rapp, K. (2012). Adaptation to novel visuo-motor transformations: further evidence of functional haptic neglect. *Experimental Brain Research*, 218(1), 129–140.
- Heuer, H. & Rapp, K. (2014). Haptic guidance interferes with learning to make movements at an angle to stimulus direction. *Experimental Brain Research*, 232(2), 675–684.
- Ho, C., Tan, H. Z., Barbagli, F., Salisbury, K., & Spence, C. (2006). Isotropy and visual modulation of haptic force direction discrimination on the human finger. In *Proceedings of Eurohaptics 2006* (pp. 483–486).

-
- Hogan, N. (1985). The mechanics of multi-joint posture and movement control. *Biological Cybernetics*, 52(5), 315–331.
- Hokayem, P. F. & Spong, M. W. (2006). Bilateral teleoperation: an historical survey. *Automatica*, 42, 2035–2057.
- Hollins, M. & Goble, A. (1988). Perception of length of voluntary movements. *Somatosensory Research*, 5(4), 335–348.
- Imanaka, K. (1989). Effect of starting position on reproduction of movement: further evidence of interference between location and distance information. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, 68(2), 423–434.
- Jacobs, R. A. (1999). Optimal integration of texture and motion cues to depth. *Vision Research*, 39(21), 3621–3629.
- Jastrow, J. (1886). The perception of space by disparate senses. *Mind*, 11(44), 539–554.
- Jenkins, G. M. & Watts, D. G. (1968). *Spectral analysis and its applications*. San Francisco: Holden-Day.
- Jones, B. (1983). Psychological analyses of haptic and haptic-visual judgements of extent. *The Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology Section A*, 35(4), 597–606.
- Jones, L. A. & Hunter, I. W. (1990). A perceptual analysis of stiffness. *Experimental Brain Research*, 79(1), 150–156.
- Jones, L. A. (1986). Perception of force and weight: theory and research. *Psychological Bulletin*, 100(1), 29–42.
- Jones, L. A. & Tan, H. Z. (2013). Application of psychophysical techniques to haptic research. *IEEE Transactions on Haptics*, 6(3), 268–284.
- Joyce, G. C., Rack, P. M. H., & Westbury, D. R. (1969). The mechanical properties of cat soleus muscle during controlled lengthening and shortening movements. *The Journal of Physiology*, 204(2), 461–474.
- Kearney, R. E. & Hunter, I. W. (1989). System identification of human joint dynamics. *Critical Reviews in Biomedical Engineering*, 18(1), 55–87.
- Kelvin, R. P. & Mulik, A. (1958). Discrimination of length by sight and touch. *Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 10(4), 187–192.
- Kimmig, A. (2013). Deductive reasoning. In W. Dubitzky, O. Wolkenhauer, K.-H. Cho, H. Yokota, & A. Kimmig (Eds.), *Encyclopedia of systems biology* (pp. 557–558). Springer New York.
- Klatzky, R. L. & Lederman, S. J. (2003). Touch. In I. Weiner (Ed.), *Handbook of psychology* (Chap. 6, Vol. 4, pp. 147–176). John Wiley and Sons, Inc.
- Korman, M., Teodorescu, K., Cohen, A., Reiner, M., & Gopher, D. (2012). Effects of order and sensory modality in stiffness perception. *Presence: Teleoperators and Virtual Environments*, 21(3), 295–304.

- Krutky, M. A., Trumbower, R. D., & Perreault, E. J. (2009). Effects of environmental instabilities on endpoint stiffness during the maintenance of human arm posture. In *Annual International Conference of the IEEE Engineering in Medicine and Biology Society* (pp. 5938–5941).
- Krutky, M. A., Ravichandran, V. J., Trumbower, R. D., & Perreault, E. J. (2010). Interactions between limb and environmental mechanics influence stretch reflex sensitivity in the human arm. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, *103*(1), 429–440.
- Kuchenbecker, K., Fiene, J., & Niemyer, G. (2006). Improving contact realism through event-based haptic feedback. *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics*, *12*(2), 219–230.
- Kuling, I. A., Brenner, E., & Smeets, J. B. J. (2013). Proprioception is robust under external forces. *PLoS ONE*, *8*(9), e74236.
- Kuling, I. A., Brenner, E., & Smeets, J. B. J. (2015). Torques do not influence proprioceptive localization of the hand. *Experimental Brain Research*, *233*(1), 61–68.
- Kuling, I. A., Brenner, E., & Smeets, J. B. J. (submitted). *Errors in visuo-haptic and haptic-haptic location matching remain consistent over long periods of time.*
- Kuling, I. A., van Beek, F. E., Mugge, W., & Smeets, J. B. J. (submitted). *Adjusting haptic guidance to idiosyncratic visuo-haptic matching errors improves performance in reaching.*
- Kurtzer, I., Crevecoeur, F., & Scott, S. H. (2014). Fast feedback control involves two independent processes utilizing knowledge of limb dynamics. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, *111*(8), 1631–1645.
- Kuschel, M., Di Luca, M., Buss, M., & Klatzky, R. (2010). Combination and integration in the perception of visual-haptic compliance information. *IEEE Transactions on Haptics*, *3*(4), 234–244.
- Lanca, M. & Bryant, D. J. (1995). Effect of orientation in haptic reproduction of line length. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, *80*(3c), 1291–1298.
- Landy, M. S., Maloney, L. T., Johnston, E. B., & Young, M. (1995). Measurement and modeling of depth cue combination: in defense of weak fusion. *Vision Research*, *35*(3), 389–412.
- Lawrence, D. (1993). Stability and transparency in bilateral teleoperation. *IEEE Transactions on Robotics and Automation*, *9*(5), 624–637.
- Lawrence, D., Pao, L. Y., Dougherty, A., Salada, M., & Pavlou, Y. (2000). Rate-hardness: a new performance metric for haptic interfaces. *IEEE Transactions on Robotics and Automation*, *16*(4), 357–371.
- Lederman, S. J. & Klatzky, R. L. (2009). Haptic perception: a tutorial. *Attention, Perception & Psychophysics*, *71*(7), 1439–1459.

-
- Lederman, S. J. & Jones, L. A. (2011). Tactile and haptic illusions. *IEEE Transactions on Haptics*, 4, 273–294.
- Leuba, J. H. (1909). The influence of the duration and of the rate of arm movements upon the judgment of their length. *The American Journal of Psychology*, 20(3), 374–385.
- Loomis, J. M. & Lederman, S. J. (1986). Tactual perception. In K. Boff, L. Kaufman, & J. Thomas (Eds.), *Handbook of perception and human performance volume ii: cognitive processes and performance* (Chap. 31, Vol. 2).
- Loomis, J. M., Klatzky, R. L., & Lederman, S. J. (1991). Similarity of tactual and visual picture recognition with limited field of view. *Perception*, 20(2), 167–177.
- Luca, M. D., Knörlein, B., Ernst, M., & Harders, M. (2011). Effects of visual-haptic asynchronies and loading-unloading movements on compliance perception. *Brain Research Bulletin*, 85(5), 245–259.
- Marayong, P. & Okamura, A. M. (2004). Speed-accuracy characteristics of human-machine cooperative manipulation using virtual fixtures with variable admittance. *Human Factors: The Journal of the Human Factors and Ergonomics Society*, 46(3), 518–532.
- Marteniuk, R. G. & Roy, E. A. (1972). The codability of kinesthetic location and distance information. *Acta Psychologica*, 36(6), 471–479.
- McCloskey, D., Ebeling, P., & Goodwin, G. (1974). Estimation of weights and tensions and apparent involvement of a 'sense of effort'. *Experimental Neurology*, 42(1), 220–232.
- McFarland, J. & Soechting, J. F. (2007). Factors influencing the radial-tangential illusion in haptic perception. *Experimental Brain Research*, 178(2), 216–227.
- McIntyre, J., Mussa-Ivaldi, F. A., & Bizzi, E. (1996). The control of stable postures in the multijoint arm. *Experimental Brain Research*, 110(2), 248–264.
- Milner, T. E. (2002). Contribution of geometry and joint stiffness to mechanical stability of the human arm. *Experimental Brain Research*, 143(4), 515–519.
- Mugge, W., Kuling, I., Brenner, E., & Smeets, J. (submitted). *Haptic guidance needs to be intuitive not just informative to improve human motor accuracy*.
- Mugge, W., Abbink, D. A., Schouten, A. C., Dewald, J. P. A., & Helm, F. C. T. (2010). A rigorous model of reflex function indicates that position and force feedback are flexibly tuned to position and force tasks. *Experimental Brain Research*, 200(3-4), 325–340.
- Mussa-Ivaldi, F., Hogan, N., & Bizzi, E. (1985). Neural, mechanical, and geometric factors subserving arm posture in humans. *Journal of Neuroscience*, 5(10), 2732–2743.
- Nisky, I., Mussa-Ivaldi, F., & Karniel, A. (2008). A regression and boundary-crossing-based model for the perception of delayed stiffness. *IEEE Transactions on Haptics*, 1(2), 73–82.

- Nitsch, V. & Färber, B. (2013). A meta-analysis of the effects of haptic interfaces on task performance with teleoperation systems. *IEEE Transactions on Haptics*, 6(4), 387–398.
- Noll, N. C. & Weber, R. J. (1985). Visual and tactile scanning: moving scan versus moving medium. *Bulletin of the Psychonomic Society*, 23(6), 473–476.
- Norman, J. F., Todd, J. T., Perotti, V. J., & Tittle, J. S. (1996). The visual perception of three-dimensional length. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception and Performance*, 22(1), 173–186.
- Nuño, E., Basañez, L., & Ortega, R. (2011). Passivity-based control for bilateral teleoperation: a tutorial. *Automatica*, 47, 485–495.
- Nuño, E., Basañez, L., Ortega, R., & Spong, M. W. (2009). Position tracking for non-linear teleoperators with variable time delay. *The International Journal of Robotics Research*, 28, 895–910.
- O'Malley, M. K. & Goldfarb, M. (2005). On the ability of humans to haptically identify and discriminate real and simulated objects. *Presence: Teleoperators and Virtual Environments*, 14(3), 366–376.
- Open Science Collaboration. (2015). Estimating the reproducibility of psychological science. *Science*, 349(6251).
- Pare, M., Carnahan, H., & Smith, A. (2002). Magnitude estimation of tangential force applied to the fingerpad. *Experimental Brain Research*, 142(3), 342–348.
- Perreault, E. J., Kirsch, R. F., & Crago, P. E. (2001). Effects of voluntary force generation on the elastic components of endpoint stiffness. *Experimental Brain Research*, 141(3), 312–323.
- Perreault, E. J., Kirsch, R. F., & Acosta, A. M. (1999). Multiple-input, multiple-output system identification for characterization of limb stiffness dynamics. *Biological Cybernetics*, 80(5), 327–337.
- Perreault, E. J., Kirsch, R. F., & Crago, P. E. (2002). Voluntary control of static endpoint stiffness during force regulation tasks. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, 87(6), 2808–2816.
- Pierce, R. & Kuchenbecker, K. (2012). A data-driven method for determining natural human-robot motion mappings in teleoperation. In *4th IEEE RAS EMBS International Conference on Biomedical Robotics and Biomechatronics (BioRob)* (pp. 169–176).
- Pierre, M. & Kirsch, R. (2002). Measuring dynamic characteristics of the human arm in three dimensional space. In *Proceedings of the 24th Annual Conference and the Annual Fall Meeting of the Biomedical Engineering Society EMBS/BMES Conference* (Vol. 3, pp. 2558–2560). Engineering in Medicine and Biology.

-
- Pongrac, H., Hinterseer, P., Kammerl, J., Steinbach, E., & Färber, B. (2006). Limitations of human 3D-force discrimination. In *Proceedings of the Second International Workshop on Human-Centered Robotics Systems*.
- Pronin, E. (2007). Perception and misperception of bias in human judgment. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, 11(1), 37–43.
- Pronin, E., Lin, D. Y., & Ross, L. (2002). The bias blind spot: perceptions of bias in self versus others. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 28(3), 369–381.
- Proske, U. & Gandevia, S. C. (2012). The proprioceptive senses: their roles in signaling body shape, body position and movement, and muscle force. *Physiological Reviews*, 92(4), 1651–1697.
- Pruszynski, J. A., Kurtzer, I., & Scott, S. H. (2011). The long-latency reflex is composed of at least two functionally independent processes. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, 106(1), 449–459.
- Rack, P. M. H. & Westbury, D. R. (1974). The short range stiffness of active mammalian muscle and its effect on mechanical properties. *The Journal of Physiology*, 240(2), 331–350.
- Raj, D., Ingty, K., & Devanandan, M. (1985). Weight appreciation in the hand in normal subjects and in patients with leprosy neuropathy. *Brain*, 108(1), 95–102.
- Rincon-Gonzalez, L., Buneo, C. A., & Helms Tillery, S. I. (2011). The proprioceptive map of the arm is systematic and stable, but idiosyncratic. *PLoS ONE*, 6(11), e25214.
- Robles-De-La-Torre, G. & Hayward, V. (2001). Force can overcome object geometry in the perception of shape through active touch. *Nature*, 412(6845), 445–448.
- Rosenberg, L. & Adelstein, B. (1993). Perceptual decomposition of virtual haptic surfaces. In *Proceedings of the IEEE Symposium on Research Frontiers in Virtual Reality* (pp. 46–53). San Jose, CA, USA.
- Ross, H. E. & Gregory, R. L. (1970). Weight illusions and weight discrimination—a revised hypothesis. *The Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 22(2), 318–328.
- Ross, H. E. (1997). On the possible relations between discriminability and apparent magnitude. *British Journal of Mathematical and Statistical Psychology*, 50(2), 187–203.
- Roy, E. A. & Diewert, G. L. (1975). Encoding of kinesthetic extent information. *Perception & Psychophysics*, 17(6), 559–564.
- Sabes, P. N., Jordan, M. I., & Wolpert, D. M. (1998). The role of inertial sensitivity in motor planning. *The Journal of Neuroscience*, 18(15), 5948–5957.
- Sarkar, N. & Yun, X. (1996). Design of a continuous controller for contact transition task based on impulsive constraint analysis. In *Proceedings of the 1996 IEEE International Conference on Robotics and Automation* (Vol. 3, pp. 2000–2005).

- Schouten, A. C., de Vlugt, E., van Hilten, J. J. B., & van der Helm, F. C. T. (2008). Quantifying proprioceptive reflexes during position control of the human arm. *IEEE Transactions on Biomedical Engineering*, 55(1), 311–321.
- Shadmehr, R., Mussa-Ivaldi, F., & Bizzi, E. (1993). Postural force fields of the human arm and their role in generating multijoint movements. *Journal of Neuroscience*, 13(1), 45–62.
- Shergill, S., Bays, P., Frith, C., & Wolpert, D. (2003). Two eyes for an eye: the neuroscience of force escalation. *Science*, 301(5630), 187.
- Sheridan, T. (1993). Space teleoperation through time delay: review and prognosis. *IEEE Transactions on Robotics and Automation*, 9(5), 592–606.
- Sigrist, R., Rauter, G., Riener, R., & Wolf, P. (2013). Augmented visual, auditory, haptic, and multimodal feedback in motor learning: a review. *Psychonomic Bulletin & Review*, 20(1), 21–53.
- Smeets, J. B. J., van den Dobbelaars, J. J., de Grave, D. D. J., van Beers, R. J., & Brenner, E. (2006). Sensory integration does not lead to sensory calibration. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 103(49), 18781–18786.
- Soechting, J. F. & Flanders, M. (1989). Sensorimotor representations for pointing to targets in three-dimensional space. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, 62(2), 582–594.
- Soechting, J. F. & Flanders, M. (2011). Multiple factors underlying haptic perception of length and orientation. *IEEE Transactions on Haptics*, 4(4), 263–272.
- Sousa, R., Brenner, E., & Smeets, J. B. J. (2010). A new binocular cue for absolute distance: disparity relative to the most distant structure. *Vision Research*, 50(18), 1786–1792.
- Sousa, R., Smeets, J. B. J., & Brenner, E. (2012). The effect of variability in other objects' sizes on the extent to which people rely on retinal image size as a cue for judging distance. *Journal of Vision*, 12(6), 1–8.
- Srinivasan, M. A. & Basdogan, C. (1997). Haptics in virtual environments: taxonomy, research status, and challenges. *Computers and Graphics*, 21(4), 393–404.
- Srinivasan, M. A. & LaMotte, R. H. (1995). Tactual discrimination of softness. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, 73(1), 88–101.
- Stanney, K. (1995). Realizing the full potential of virtual reality: human factors issues that could stand in the way. In *Proceedings of the Virtual Reality Annual International Symposium (VRAIS '95)* (pp. 28–34).
- Stelmach, G. E. & Kelso, J. S. (1975). Memory trace strength and response biasing in short-term motor memory. *Memory & Cognition*, 3(1), 58–62.
- Stelmach, G. E., Kelso, J. S., & McCullagh, P. D. (1976). Preselection and response biasing in short-term motor memory. *Memory & Cognition*, 4(1), 62–66.

-
- Stelmach, G. E. & Wilson, M. (1970). Kinesthetic retention, movement extent, and information processing. *Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 85(3), 425–430.
- Stevens, S. (1957). On the psychophysical law. *The Psychological Review*, 64(3), 153–181.
- Stevens, S. & Stone, G. (1959). Finger span: ratio scale, category scale, and JND scale. *Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 57(2), 91–95.
- Sun, D., Naghdy, F., & Du, H. (2014). Application of wave-variable control to bilateral teleoperation systems: a survey. *Annual Reviews in Control*, 38, 12–31.
- Symmons, M., Richardson, B., & Wuillemin, D. (2004). Active versus passive touch: superiority depends more on the task than the mode. In S. Ballesteros & M. Heller (Eds.), *Touch, blindness, and neuroscience* (pp. 179–185). Madrid, Spain: UNED Press.
- Tan, H. Z., Pang, X. D., & Durlach, N. I. (1992). Manual resolution of length, force and compliance. In H. Kazerooni (Ed.), *Advances in robotics* (Vol. 42, pp. 13–18). The American Society of Mechanical Engineers.
- Tan, H. Z., Barbagli, F., Salisbury, K., Ho, C., & Spence, C. (2006). Force-direction discrimination is not influenced by reference force direction. *Haptics-e*, 4, 1–6.
- Tan, H. Z., Durlach, N. I., Beauregard, G. L., & Srinivasan, M. A. (1995). Manual discrimination of compliance using active pinch grasp: the roles of force and work cues. *Perception & Psychophysics*, 57(4), 495–510.
- Tanaka, Y., Yamada, N., Nishikawa, K., Masamori, I., & Tsuji, T. (2005). Manipulability analysis of human arm movements during the operation of a variable-impedance controlled robot. In *IEEE/RSJ International Conference on Intelligent Robots and Systems* (pp. 1893–1898).
- Tanaka, Y. & Tsuji, T. (2008). Directional properties of human hand force perception in the maintenance of arm posture. In M. Ishikawa, K. Doya, H. Miyamoto, & T. Yamakawa (Eds.), *Neural information processing* (Vol. 4984, pp. 933–942). Lecture Notes in Computer Science. Springer Berlin/ Heidelberg.
- Teghtsoonian, M. & Teghtsoonian, R. (1965). Seen and felt length. *Psychonomic Science*, 3, 465–466.
- Teghtsoonian, R. & Teghtsoonian, M. (1970). Two varieties of perceived length. *Perception & Psychophysics*, 8(6), 389–392.
- Terada, K., Kumazaki, A., Miyata, D., & Ito, A. (2006). Haptic length display based on cutaneous-proprioceptive integration. *Journal of Robotics and Mechatronics*, 18(4), 489–498.
- Toffin, D., McIntyre, J., Droulez, J., Kemeny, A., & Berthoz, A. (2003). Perception and reproduction of force direction in the horizontal plane. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, 90(5), 3040–3053.

- Trumbower, R. D., Krutky, M. A., Yang, B.-S., & Perreault, E. J. (2009). Use of self-selected postures to regulate multi-joint stiffness during unconstrained tasks. *PLoS ONE*, 4(5), e5411.
- Tsuji, T., Morasso, P., Goto, K., & Ito, K. (1995). Human hand impedance characteristics during maintained posture. *Biological Cybernetics*, 72(6), 475–485.
- Van Beek, F. E., Bergmann Tiest, W. M., Gabrielse, F. L., Lagerberg, B. W. J., Verhoogt, T. K., Wolfs, B. G. A., & Kappers, A. M. L. (2014). Subject-specific distortions in haptic perception of force direction. In M. Auvray & C. Duriez (Eds.), *Haptics: Neuroscience, Devices, Modeling, and Applications, Part I* (Vol. 8618, pp. 48–54). Lecture Notes in Computer Science. Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Van Beek, F. E., Bergmann Tiest, W. M., & Kappers, A. M. L. (2013). Anisotropy in the haptic perception of force direction and magnitude. *IEEE Transactions on Haptics*, 6(4), 399–407.
- Van Beek, F. E., Bergmann Tiest, W. M., Mugge, W., & Kappers, A. M. L. (2015). Haptic perception of force magnitude and its relation to postural arm dynamics in 3D. *Scientific Reports*, 5, 18004.
- Van Beek, F. E., Heck, D. J. F., Nijmeijer, H., Bergmann Tiest, W. M., & Kappers, A. M. L. (2015). The effect of damping on the perception of hardness. In *Proceedings of the IEEE World Haptics Conference (WHC)* (pp. 82–87). Evanston, IL, USA.
- Van Beers, R. J. (2009). Motor learning is optimally tuned to the properties of motor noise. *Neuron*, 63(3), 406–417.
- Van Beers, R. J., Sittig, A. C., & Denier van der Gon, J. J. (1998). The precision of proprioceptive position sense. *Experimental Brain Research*, 122(4), 367–377.
- Van Beers, R. J., Sittig, A. C., & Denier van der Gon, J. J. (1999). Integration of proprioceptive and visual position-information: an experimentally supported model. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, 81(3), 1355–1364.
- Van der Helm, F. C. T., Schouten, A. C., de Vlugt, E., & Brouwn, G. G. (2002). Identification of intrinsic and reflexive components of human arm dynamics during postural control. *Journal of Neuroscience Methods*, 119(1), 1–14.
- Van der Helm, P. A. (2010). Weber-Fechner behavior in symmetry perception? *Attention, Perception, & Psychophysics*, 72(7), 1854–1864.
- Van der Kooij, K., Brenner, E., van Beers, R. J., Schot, W. D., & Smeets, J. B. J. (2013). Alignment to natural and imposed mismatches between the senses. *Journal of Neurophysiology*, 109(7), 1890–1899.
- Van der Linde, R. & Lammertse, P. (2003). HapticMaster - a generic force controlled robot for human interaction. *Industrial Robot: An International Journal*, 30(6), 515–524.

-
- Van Doorn, G. H., Richardson, B. L., Symmons, M. A., & Howell, J. L. (2012). Cutaneous inputs yield judgments of line length that are equal to, or better than, those based on kinesthetic inputs. In P. Isokoski & J. Springare (Eds.), *Haptics: perception, devices, mobility, and communication* (Vol. 7283, pp. 25–30). Lecture Notes in Computer Science. Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Van Doren, C. L. (1995). Cross-modality matches of finger span and line length. *Perception & Psychophysics*, 57(4), 555–568.
- Vicentini, M., Galvan, S., Botturi, D., & Fiorini, P. (2010). Evaluation of force and torque magnitude discrimination thresholds on the human hand-arm system. *ACM Transactions on Applied Perception*, 8(1), 1–16.
- Vicentini, M. & Botturi, D. (2010). Perceptual issues improve haptic systems performance. In M. H. Zadeh (Ed.). *Advances in Haptics*. InTech.
- Vitello, M. P., Ernst, M. O., & Fritschi, M. (2006). An instance of tactile suppression: active exploration impairs tactile sensitivity for the direction of lateral movement. In *Proceedings of Eurohaptics 2006* (pp. 351–355).
- Wapner, S., Weinberg, J., Glick, J., & Rand, G. (1967). Effect of speed of movement on tactual-kinesthetic perception of extent. *The American Journal of Psychology*, 80(4), 608–613.
- Weber, E. (1978/1834). De tactu. In H. Ross & D. Murray (Eds.). *E.H. Weber On The Tactile Senses*. Hove: Erlbaum (UK) Taylor & Francis.
- Wong, T. S. (1977). Dynamic properties of radial and tangential movements as determinants of the haptic horizontal-vertical illusion with an L figure. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception & Performance*, 3(1), 151–164.
- Yang, X.-D., Bischof, W., & Boulanger, P. (2008a). Perception of haptic force magnitude during hand movements. In *Proceedings of the IEEE International Conference on Robotics and Automation* (pp. 2061–2066).
- Yang, X.-D., Bischof, W., & Boulanger, P. (2008b). The effects of hand motion on haptic perception of force direction. In M. Ferre (Ed.), *Haptics: perception, devices and scenarios* (Vol. 5024, pp. 355–360). Lecture Notes in Computer Science. Springer Berlin/Heidelberg.