

VU Research Portal

Adaptive Support for Human-Computer Teams

van Maanen, P.

2010

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

van Maanen, P. (2010). *Adaptive Support for Human-Computer Teams: Exploring the Use of Cognitive Models of Trust and Attention*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Contents

I	Introduction and Methodology	1
1	Introduction	3
1	Problem Statement	5
2	Research Objective	6
3	Background	6
3.1	Adaptive Support for Human-Computer Teams	6
3.2	Exploring the Use of Cognitive Models of Trust and Attention	7
4	Support System Design	8
5	Research Methodology	10
6	Overview of the Thesis	13
2	Integrating Human Factors and Artificial Intelligence in the Development of Human-Machine Cooperation	21
1	Introduction	23
2	The Cognitive Engineering Method CE+	24
3	Case-studies	24
3.1	Personal Assistant for onLine Services	24
3.2	Context Aware Communication Terminal and USer	25
3.3	Situated Usability engineering for Interactive Task Environments	26
3.4	Human-Machine Task Integration	28
4	Conclusion	29
II	Trust	33
3	Towards Task Allocation Decision Support by means of Cognitive Modeling of Trust	35
1	Introduction	37
2	Cognitive Theory	37
3	Formal Cognitive Model	39
4	Experiment Design	41
5	Discussion	42

4	Closed-Loop Adaptive Decision Support Based on Automated Trust Assessment	45
1	Introduction	47
2	Theoretical Background	48
3	Conceptual Design of Reliance Decision Support	49
3.1	Feedback	50
3.2	Reliance	50
3.3	Meta-reliance	50
4	Implementation and Evaluation	51
4.1	The Task	51
4.2	Design of the Aid	51
4.3	Experimental Results	52
5	Conclusion	53
5	Reliance on Advice of Decision Aids: Order of Advice and Causes of Under-Reliance	55
1	Introduction	57
2	Background	58
3	Hypotheses	59
3.1	Self Bias and Order of Advice	59
3.2	Understandability of Underlying Reasoning	60
3.3	Feeling of Responsibility	60
3.4	Accuracy of Perceived Reliability	61
3.5	Attribution Bias	61
4	Method	62
4.1	Participants	62
4.2	Apparatus	62
4.3	Design	64
4.4	Independent Variables	64
4.5	Dependent Variables	64
5	Results	65
5.1	Self Bias and Order of Advice (Hypothesis 1)	65
5.2	Understandability of Underlying Reasoning (Hypotheses 2 and 3)	66
5.3	Feeling of Responsibility (Hypothesis 4)	68
5.4	Accuracy of Perceived Reliability (Hypothesis 5)	68
5.5	Attribution Bias (Hypotheses 6 and 7)	69
6	Conclusion	69
6	Aiding Human Reliance Decision Making Using Computational Models of Trust	73
1	Introduction	75
2	Task Environment	76
3	Decision Aid Design	77
4	Method	78
4.1	Participants	78

4.2	Design	78
5	Results	79
6	Conclusion	80
7	Validation and Verification of Agent Models for Trust: Independent Compared to Relative Trust	83
1	Introduction	85
2	Agent Models for Trust	86
2.1	Independent Trust Model	86
2.2	Relative Trust Model	86
3	Method	87
3.1	Participants	87
3.2	Task	87
3.3	Data Collection	88
3.4	Parameter Adaptation	88
3.5	Validation	90
3.6	Verification	90
4	Results	92
4.1	Validation Results	92
4.2	Verification Results	93
5	Discussion and Conclusions	94
8	Effects of Reliance Support on Team Performance by Advising and Adaptive Autonomy	101
1	Introduction	103
2	Reliance Support	104
2.1	Generic Model	104
2.2	Proposed Support Types	105
2.3	Hypotheses	106
3	Method	107
3.1	Participants	107
3.2	Apparatus	107
3.3	Design	108
3.4	Independent Variables	108
3.5	Dependent Variables	110
3.6	Procedure	111
4	Results	111
4.1	Team Performance	111
4.2	Satisfaction	111
4.3	Effectiveness due to Human Competence	111
4.4	Effectiveness due to Task Difficulty	112
5	Discussion and Conclusions	112

III Attention

117

9	Augmented Meta-Cognition Addressing Dynamic Allocation of Tasks Requiring Visual Attention	119
1	Introduction	121
2	Augmented Meta-Cognition: Motivational Background	122
3	Augmented Meta-Cognition Design	122
3.1	Prescriptive and Descriptive Models	122
3.2	Some Principles of SDT	123
4	Applications	124
4.1	Multitask	124
4.2	Tactical Picture Compilation Simulator	125
5	Discussion	127
10	Simulation and Formal Analysis of Visual Attention	129
1	Introduction	131
2	Visual Attention	132
3	A Mathematical Model for Visual Attention	134
3.1	Attention Values, Objects and Spaces	134
3.2	Gaze	134
3.3	Saliency Maps	135
3.4	Normalization	135
3.5	Persistency and Decay	135
3.6	Concentration	136
4	Case Study	136
4.1	Task	136
4.2	Simulation Model	137
4.3	Simulation Results	138
5	Temporal Relational Specification and Verification	138
5.1	Temporal Relational Specification of Attentional States	139
5.2	Temporal Relational Specification of Attentional Sub-processes	140
5.3	Formal Specification and Analysis	141
5.4	Analysis Results	144
6	Discussion	145
11	Design and Validation of HABTA: Human Attention-Based Task Allocator	153
1	Introduction	155
2	Human Error in the Allocation of Attention	156
2.1	Under-allocation of Attention	156
2.2	Over-allocation of Attention	157
3	Design Requirements	157
4	Validation	158
4.1	Task Description	159
4.2	Experiment 1: Validation of the Descriptive Model	161
4.3	Experiment 2: Validation of the HABTA-Based Support	162

5	Intermediary Results	162
6	Conclusion and Discussion	163
12	Effects of Task Performance and Task Complexity on the Validity of Computational Models of Attention	167
1	Introduction	169
1.1	Allocation of Attention	170
1.2	Task Complexity	170
1.3	Task Performance	171
2	Method	171
2.1	Participants	171
2.2	Task	171
2.3	Design	172
2.4	Independent Variables	172
2.5	Dependent Variables	172
2.6	Procedure	172
3	Results	173
3.1	Manipulation Check	173
3.2	Main Effects	173
3.3	Effect of Model Type	173
3.4	Effect of Task Complexity	173
3.5	Effect of Task Performance	174
4	Conclusion and Discussion	174
13	Personalization of Computational Models of Attention by Simulated Annealing Parameter Tuning	177
1	Introduction	179
2	Attention Model	180
2.1	Description of the Attention Model	180
2.2	Individual Differences in Attention	180
3	Method	181
3.1	Simulation-Based Training Environment	181
3.2	Participants and Procedure	181
4	Personalization of Computational Models of Attention	182
4.1	Parameters to be Tuned	182
4.2	Simulated Annealing Parameter Tuning	182
4.3	Subjective Evaluation Measure	183
4.4	Data Analysis	184
5	Results	184
6	Discussion	185
14	A System to Support Attention Allocation: Development and Application	187
1	Introduction	189
2	Manipulation of Attention	190
3	A Theory of Mind for Attention	190

3.1	Overall Setting	190
3.2	Dynamic Attention Model	191
3.3	Model for Beliefs about Attention	192
3.4	Model to Determine Discrepancy	192
3.5	Decision Model for Attention Adjustment	192
4	Simulation Results	194
5	Case Study	195
5.1	Environment	195
5.2	Implementation	195
5.3	Results	197
6	Validation	197
7	Verification	198
8	Formal Analysis	199
9	Discussion	200

15 Adaptive Attention Allocation Support: Effects of System Conservativeness and Human Competence 207

1	Introduction	209
2	Background	210
2.1	Unreliable Automation	210
2.2	Adaptive Automation	211
3	Attention Allocation Support	211
3.1	Generic Support Model	211
3.2	Hypotheses	212
4	Method	213
4.1	Participants	213
4.2	Apparatus	213
4.3	Design	214
4.4	Independent Variables	214
4.5	Dependent Variables	215
4.6	Procedure	215
4.7	Statistical Analysis	216
5	Results	216
5.1	Task Performance	216
5.2	Trust	216
5.3	Understandability	217
5.4	Responsibility	217
6	Conclusion and Discussion	218

IV Research Overview and General Discussion 221

16	Research Overview and General Discussion 223
1	Research Overview 223
2	General Discussion 236

V Appendices	239
Bibliography	241
Acknowledgments	247
Curriculum Vitae	249
Samenvatting	251
SIKS Dissertation Series	255