

VU Research Portal

Interrupting the church's flow

Barrett, A.D.

2017

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Barrett, A. D. (2017). Interrupting the church's flow: Engaging Graham Ward and Romand Coles in a radically receptive political theology in the urban margins. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Contents

	Detailed table of contents	iv
	Table of figures	ix
	Acknowledgments	x
Chapter 1	<i>Entangled Dramas</i>	1
Chapter 2	<i>Mapping the terrain: public, liberation and ecclesial political theologies</i>	20
Chapter 3	<i>Engaging Graham Ward as ecclesial political theologian</i>	56
Chapter 4	<i>Interrupting the church's flow: Ward's 'schizoid' christology, and repressed 'others'</i>	96
Chapter 5	<i>Engaging Romand Coles as post-liberal 'theologian' of receptivity</i>	126
Chapter 6	<i>Trajectories</i>	178
Appendix 1	Interview with Graham Ward (transcript)	220
Appendix 2	Interview with Phil Howkins (transcript)	235
	Bibliography	244
	Summary	286

Detailed Table of Contents

Chapter 1	<i>Entangled Dramas</i>	1
1.1	Dramas of exclusion: discourses of ‘othering’, dynamics of ‘expulsion’	
1.2	Who acts? Discourses of agency and interaction within the ‘urban margins’	
1.3	Locating the church: questions of ecclesial agency within the urban margins	
1.4	Research question: developing a radically receptive ecclesiology in the urban margins	
1.5	Locating myself	
1.6	Charting the trajectory/ies: overview of chapters	
Chapter 2	<i>Mapping the terrain: public, liberation and ecclesial political theologies</i>	20
2.1	Introduction	
2.2	Political theology: in search of definition	
	2.2.1 <i>Sharpening the focus</i>	
2.3	Public Theology	
	2.3.1 <i>Defining the ‘public’: Who speaks? Who acts? Who hears? Who is heard?</i>	
	2.3.2 <i>Rules of engagement: how does theology ‘go public’?</i>	
	2.3.3 <i>Public theology in a post-secular context: gifts and challenges</i>	
2.4	Liberation Theology	
	2.4.1 <i>‘Doing’ theology: Who speaks? Who acts? Who hears? Who is heard?</i>	
	2.4.2 <i>Liberation Theology UK?</i>	
	2.4.3 <i>Recent developments and critical questions within liberation theology</i>	
	2.4.4 <i>Critical questions to liberation theology: a (re)turn to the church</i>	
2.5	Ecclesial political theology	
	2.5.1 <i>Communities of faithful witness: MacIntyre, Barth and ‘Hauerwasian’ political theologians</i>	
	2.5.2 <i>Radical Orthodoxy: ontology, participation and ‘transcendent’ authority</i>	
	2.5.3 <i>The authority of Christ’s judgment: a mix of Barthian and Schmittian trajectories?</i>	
	2.5.4 <i>An ecclesial receptivity within EPT?</i>	
2.6	Political theologies and the urban margins: discerning a way forward	

- 3.1 **The ailments of the postmodern city**
 - 3.1.1 *The economic*
 - 3.1.2 *The cultural*
 - 3.1.3 *The political*
- 3.2 **An embodied challenge: on Manchester's Oxford Road**
- 3.3 **Diagnosis: two cities, two economies, two desires**
 - 3.3.1 *Surveying the terrain*
 - 3.3.2 *An 'analogical worldview'*
 - 3.3.3 *Augustine, desire and the City of God*
 - 3.3.4 *Postmodern and 'Christian' desire*
 - 3.3.5 *The flow of love: kenosis and pleroma*
- 3.4 **Therapy: Church as 'alternative erotic communities'**
 - 3.4.1 *Church and eucharist: overcoming division*
 - 3.4.2 *Church and cultural politics: reschooling the (cultural) imaginary*
 - 3.4.3 *Church and prayer: inhabiting the eschatological tension*
 - 3.4.4 *Church and service of those 'in need': incorporating 'the stranger'*
- 3.5 **Evaluation: Ward's ecclesiological equivocation**
 - 3.5.1 *Church as 'corpus permixtum': humble, but anxious?*
 - 3.5.2 *Church as 'apophatic body of Christ': 'emerging', or invisible?*
 - 3.5.3 *Church as 'erotic community': 'transgressive', or colonial?*
 - 3.5.4 *Church as 'heavenly city': 'prefiguring', or triumphant?*
- 3.6 **Summary**

- 4.1 **'Penetrating' the urban margins: *The Full Monty* and 'violent no-go zones'**
- 4.2 **Ward's 'radical orthodoxy': a patriarchal, sexual, and imperialist logic?**
- 4.3 **Christological openings**
 - 4.3.1 *Irigaray and christology in the 'between'*
 - 4.3.2 *The 'schizoid Christ' and the woman with the haemorrhage*
- 4.4 **Openings foreclosed: two versions of an anointing, and other displacements**
 - 4.4.1 *'Economic' problems and other 'displacements'*
 - 4.4.2 *Retreating from the challenge of the other*

1. *The woman with the haemorrhage and the Syro-Phoenician woman*
 2. *Luce Irigaray*
 3. *Emmanuel Levinas*
 4. *Jacques Lacan and the 'real'*
- 4.4.3 *Retreating from the materiality of Jesus*
- 4.4.4 *Retreating from the particularity of christology*
- 4.4.5 *Retreating from the engagement of praxis*
- 4.5 **A 'mended middle'? Ward's awkward appropriation of Gillian Rose**
- 4.6 **Holding open the 'opening': returning Ward to his senses**
- 4.6.1 *Reversing Ward's 'retreats'*

Chapter 5 ***Engaging Romand Coles*** **126**
as post-liberal 'theologian' of receptivity

- 5.1 **Introduction**
- 5.2 **Returning to the challenge of the other**
- 5.2.1 *'Traditionalism': particular visions of flourishing and 'overconfident' communities?*
- 5.2.2 *Augustinians, 'outsides' and 'one-way' caritas*
- 5.2.3 *Derrida, deconstruction and 'ateleological openness'*
- 5.2.4 *A two-fold proposal: tension-dwelling between the teleological and the ateleological*
- 5.3 **Returning to praxis: developing a 'visionary pragmatism' for practised receptivity**
- 5.3.1 *The fecundity of the 'edge'*
- 5.3.2 *'Visionary pragmatism'*
- 5.3.3 *Radical democratic practices of receptivity*
1. *Listening*
 2. *World-travelling*
 3. *Tabling*
- 5.4 **Learning from 'David' and 'Goliath': fleshing out a 'visionary pragmatism'**
- 5.4.1 *Re-visiting Ward's 'economies' with Coles: 'mega-circulations', 'disbelief' and 'polyface flows'*
- 5.4.2 *Politics of shock and countershock*
- 5.4.3 *Reconfiguring hope for a 'storm-shocked' world*

- 5.5 **Coles' 'ecclesial turn': a 'christeccentric', dialogical, 'radically insufficient' church**
- 5.5.1 *John Howard Yoder: the vulnerable receptivity of the church's 'body practices'*
- 5.5.2 *Rowan Williams: 'Christ on Trial' and the 'penumbral' edges of the ecclesial body*
1. *Ward's Johannine trial: a contestation of authority*
 2. *Williams' Markan trial: kenosis of territoriality, kenosis of language*
 3. *Williams' 'christeccentric' ecclesiology*
- 5.5.3 *Charles Taylor, Sam Wells, and a radically 'insufficient', 'thirsting' church*
- 5.5.4 *Jean Vanier's 'footwashed politics', a 'receptive' Jesus, and a mysterious 'whirling'*
- 5.6 **Summary: from Ward's christological domestication to Coles' christological equivocation**

Chapter 6

Trajectories

178

- 6.1 **Re-cap**
- 6.1.1 *Developing a 'radically receptive political theology'*
- 6.2 **Tactical theological stances**
- 6.2.1 *Locating the theologian*
- 6.2.2 *Dis-locating the theologian*
1. *'Dislocation', 'exorcism', and a Christ receptive to 'initiation' by others*
 2. *Dis-identifying with Jesus*
- 6.2.3 *'Flipping the axis': negotiating the equivocation of the christological*
- 6.2.4 *Expecting abundance: shifting from the 'centre' to the 'edge'*
- 6.2.5 *Letting the ghosts speak: re-awakening our senses to our repressed 'others'*
- 6.2.6 *The Full Monty and a 'constitutive outside'*
- 6.3 **Tactical ontologies**
- 6.3.1 *Participating in divine receptivity: 'hearing with God's ears'*
- 6.3.2 *Returning to the flow(s): christological openings to capitalism's 'outside'*
- 6.3.3 *From 'penetrating bodies' to 'touching flesh'*
- 6.3.4 *The 'go-between God': a pneumatological trajectory?*

6.4 Practices

6.4.1 *Re-locating the theologian: re-rooting and re-routing*

6.4.2 *Resisting initiative: the 'art of pregnant waiting'*

6.4.3 *Practising 'confession' – with our 'others'*

6.4.4 *Spaces of contestation, negotiation and 'contagious receptivity'*

6.4.5 *Tabling and 'para-liturgies'*

6.4.6 *Liturgical gathering, formation in receptivity and liturgies of 'countershock'*

6.4.7 *Prayer*

6.5 Returning

6.5.1 *Returning to the Church of England*

1. *A parish church*

2. *A liturgical, eucharistic, 'incarnational' church*

3. *A national church*

6.5.2 *Returning with Ward to the Oxford Road*

6.5.3 *Returning to the Bromford Passion Play*

6.5.4 *Returning... to resurrection?*

Table of Figures

1.1	Crucifixion scene, Bromford Passion Play 2013	2
1.2	Forms of agency exercised by people living with poverty (Ruth Lister)	7
3.1	The 'flow' of divine love	84
5.1	'Wormholes' in space-time, as conceived in theoretical physics	158
6.1	'Flipping' the christological axis	188
6.2	Practices of 'polyface' formation	209

Acknowledgments

One of the most wonderful challenges of writing a thesis on radical receptivity, whilst learning to practise it, is attempting to make any kind of comprehensive list of the people whose wisdom and insight, questions and challenges, have made a significant contribution to the words that been written here. There are so many!

Most immediately, I am thankful for those who have paid closest attention to the writing of the thesis itself, encouraged the countless tangential trains of thought, helped me find a focus and, most critically, helped me stick to it and see it through. For my supervisors, Richard Sudworth, David Hewlett and Eddy Van der Borgh; and for those who shared smaller parts of the supervisory journey, Nicola Slee, Ashley Cocksworth and Kevin Ellis. I am also immensely thankful to Mark Pryce and Bishop David Urquhart, both for agreeing financial support to help make this possible, and for their encouragement along the way. Michael Gale, Queen's Foundation librarian, has been endlessly patient with my constant failures to return books on time, and almost limitless in his responses to my requests for new purchases – this thesis would not be half as rich without his generous resourcing.

I am thankful also for those who, entirely voluntarily, have read (or attempted to read) either selected chapters or the entire draft, and responded with encouragement, questions, suggestions, or urges to expunge every superfluous inverted comma: Chris Allen, Andy Delmege, Tim Evans, Sam Ewell, Jessica and Simon Foster, Sophie and Keith Hebden, Rachel Mann, Sally Nash, Jane Perry, Andrea Russell, Cormac Russell and Susie Snyder.

I am deeply indebted also to those who, in January 2014, sat around a table at the Queen's Foundation with a ridiculously ambitious proto-proposal in front of them, and enthusiastically identified at least seven different PhDs that could have sprung from it: Sam Ewell, Gary Hall, David Hewlett, John Hull, Kate Pearson, Nicola Slee and Richard Sudworth. And for those who, a few months later, offered comments on a slightly-more-coherent proposal, that enabled me to begin to find that elusive focus: Chris Allen, Ruard Ganzevoort, Rachel Mann, Jane Perry, Nigel Pimlott, John Reader, and Anna Rowlands.

The work here has also been profoundly shaped in spaces where I have had the privilege of being able to 'try out' some of my thinking on both academics and practitioners (and many people who are both, and much more). Some of those spaces (and those who have convened them) include:

- 'Thinking Aloud' sessions in Hodge Hill (especially those involving input from Anna Ruddick and Mike Pears)
- Birmingham 'Strengthening Estates Ministry' gatherings (Andy Delmege)
- Bishop of Birmingham's Round Table Theology Group (Mark Pryce)
- West Midlands Urban, Political and Public Theology group
- Research seminars, Queen's Birmingham (Nicola Slee)
- 'Gendered approaches to faith' module, Queen's Birmingham (Nicola Slee & Donald Eadie)
- Gatherings of clergy and community workers in Chester (David Herbert), Durham (Val Barron), Lichfield (David Primrose) and Nottingham & Southwell (David McCoulough) Dioceses

- Gathering of the Church Urban Fund's Together Network development workers (Jenny Baker), and a couple of Church Urban Fund annual conferences (Bethany Eckley)
- Church of Scotland Priority Areas annual consultation 2014 (Martin Johnstone, with Ann Morisy)
- Inhabit Conference 2015 / New Parish Conference 2016 (Rosalyn Clare)
- 'Between Theology and the Political' Conference, University of Manchester, 2015 (Charlie Pemberton)
- 'Self and the City' Conference, University of Manchester, 2015 (Ben Wood)
- 'Politics of Hope' conference 2015, William Temple Foundation & Livability (Chris Baker)
- Society for the Study of Christian Ethics Conference 2015 (Anna Rowlands)
- Interview with Graham Ward at Christ Church, Oxford, 2015
- Theology & Religion seminar, University of Leeds, 2016 (Rachel Muers)
- Liberation theology seminar, University of Durham, 2016 (Anna Rowlands)
- Church Action on Poverty 'Church of the Poor' conference 2016 (Liam Purcell & Niall Cooper)
- Sandwell Churches Link Conference 2017 (Laura Nott)

Countless conversations have arisen more spontaneously, through which insights have been first glimpsed, ideas tested out, thoughts clarified, pretentiousness challenged, and much more. Here I most risk missing out significant people, but some of the most memorably helpful conversations have been with Jo Bagby, Julia Bingham, Mole Chapman, Andy Delmege, Bethany Eckley, Kathy Evans, Tim Evans, Sam Ewell, Jess Foster, Simon Foster, Andrew Grinnell, Simon Heathfield, Keith Hebden, Marilyn Hull, Martin Johnstone, Alison Joyce, Peter Kenyon, Mike Mather, Sarah Maxfield, Ann Morisy, Rachel Muers, Sally Nash, Kate Pearson, Jane Perry, Fred Rattley, Anthony Reddie, Anna Rowlands, Cormac Russell, Chris Shannahan, Andrew Smith, Susie Snyder, David Warbrick, Keith White and Paul Wright.

More practically, some people and communities have offered hospitality, care, food and childcare at times when those things have been most needed, in the midst of the pressures of full-time ministry and part-time PhD-writing. Among them I owe the deepest gratitude to my mum and dad (Lesley and Peter Barrett), my parents-in-law (Jim and Liz Andrews), and Ria and Tim Evans, and to Genny Tunbridge at Hodge Hill's Old Rectory Community House, the sisters of the Community of St John the Divine, Alum Rock, and the brothers of the Franciscan house at Glasshampton.

I am quite frankly amazed that friends and colleagues, neighbours and congregation members, in Hodge Hill have patiently borne with me over the last 5½ years as my attention has been distracted, my mind over-full, my sermons and meetings all-too-often ill-prepared, my availability and diary constricted and my competence reduced by this 'other thing' that I have somehow shoe-horned into my life. Not least among them, I am deeply grateful to Tim Evans, Penny Hall, Sarah Maxfield, Sally Nash, Florence Parkes, Gloria Smith, Genny Tunbridge, Sarah Ward and Paul Wright.

Traditionally, last place in the acknowledgments is the place of most honour. Here it demands a four-way split. Janey, my wife of 10 years, has put up with this thesis for over half our married life, encouraged me to 'push the button' in the first place, and has borne with me (and it) with seemingly infinite patience and generosity, through long evenings, restless nights, deeply insightful (on her part, at least) conversations, and days when either my mind or body (or both) have been elsewhere. From the very first time we met onwards, she has embodied to me 'disruptive grace' in its most

abundant, grace-full expression. Rafi (8) and Adia (5) have lived with this too – for most, or all of their lives. They have both tried their hardest *not* to interrupt Daddy when he’s been ‘doing his PhD’, and yet also provided the most wonderful interruptions to it. They, perhaps more than any others, are still teaching me what truly radical receptivity looks like in the flesh. But the lives of our little family are also joyfully and inextricably entangled in the lives of our friends and neighbours on the Firs and Bromford estate, who have enriched our lives beyond measure with their kindness, creativity, passion and imagination. Among them, one person particularly has taught me more about the unimaginable gifts that come to us when we dare to say Yes to the strangest of invitations and offers, and that is the founder and *impresario* of the Bromford Theatre Group, Phil Howkins. The work here – a mere fragment of a much greater, and even more widely shared, labour of love in which it participates – is dedicated, with immeasurable gratitude, to Janey, Rafi, Adia and Phil.

However satisfying writing is – that mix of discipline and miracle, which leaves you in control, even when what appears on the page has emerged from regions beyond your control – it is a very poor substitute indeed for the joy and the agony of loving.

(Gillian Rose, *Love’s Work*¹)

¹ Rose 2011 [1995]:59