Critical career transitions & career development
Melker, G.P.

2017

document version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link to publication in VU Research Portal

citation for published version (APA)

General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address: vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Download date: 22. Aug. 2024
Contents

List of tables 12
List of figures 14
List of text boxes 14

1. Introduction 17
   1.1. Overview 18
   1.2. Career development and critical career transitions 20
   1.3. Goal and research questions 21
   1.4. Structure of the thesis 22

2. Critical career transitions from a theoretical point of view 25
   2.1. Introduction 26
   2.2. Management and managerial behavior 26
       2.2.1. Taxonomies of managerial behavior 29
       2.2.2. Dimensions and situations of management 32
       2.2.3. Management role versus management style 33
       2.2.4. Competencies versus competences 35
   2.3. Careers and career transitions 37
       2.3.1. Careers: definitions and trends 37
       2.3.2. Definitions of career transitions 39
       2.3.3. Types of career transitions 42
       2.3.4. Louis' typology of career transitions 45
       2.3.5. Focus of this study 49
       2.3.6. The process of career transitions: the transition cycle 51
       2.3.7. Louis' essential transition tasks 55
       2.3.8. The magnitude of career transitions 56
   2.4. The success of critical career transitions 60
       2.4.1. What is effectiveness? 60
       2.4.2. What is a successful critical career transition? 61
       2.4.3. Objective and subjective career success criteria 63
       2.4.4. Hall's career effectiveness 67
       2.4.5. Nicholson’s positive and negative transition cycles 71
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.4.6.</td>
<td>Objective versus subjective career elements</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.</td>
<td>Career development en career management</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1.</td>
<td>Definitions of career development and career management</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2.</td>
<td>The multiple career concept model</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.</td>
<td>Management development and social support</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1.</td>
<td>Management development: definitions and activities</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2.</td>
<td>Career transitions and managerial learning</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3.</td>
<td>Role learning and career transitions</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3.1.</td>
<td>Role attributes</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3.2.</td>
<td>Sources of support</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3.3.</td>
<td>Individual differences</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.</td>
<td>Jaques' levels of work</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.1.</td>
<td>Time-span measurement</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.2.</td>
<td>Jaques' time span and formal role sets</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3.</td>
<td>Levels of work and time span</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8.</td>
<td>Keil and Cortina's cusp model</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9.</td>
<td>Mumford's leadership skills strataplex</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10.</td>
<td>Summary and syntheses</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Critical career transitions from a practical point of view</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.</td>
<td>Watkins' first 90 days</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.</td>
<td>The Shell competence matrix (MITRE model)</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.</td>
<td>Job challenges and levels of management</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2.</td>
<td>Critical comments concerning the MITRE model</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.</td>
<td>The Leadership Pipeline model</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1.</td>
<td>Critical career passages and job requirements</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.</td>
<td>The six critical career passages</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.</td>
<td>Critical comments concerning the Leadership Pipeline model</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Results of pilot studies</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.</td>
<td>Pilot study 1: HR experts</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.</td>
<td>Objectives and research questions</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.</td>
<td>Method</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3.</td>
<td>Results</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.</td>
<td>Conclusions from pilot study 1</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.</td>
<td>Pilot study 2: (former) CEOs</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1.</td>
<td>Objectives and research questions</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.</td>
<td>Method</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.</td>
<td>Results</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3.4. Conclusions from pilot study 2 | 156
4.4. Pilot study 3: Top managers of for-profit organizations | 157
4.4.1. Objectives and research questions | 157
4.4.2. Method | 157
4.4.3. Results | 158
4.4.4. Conclusions from pilot study 3 | 163
4.5. Pilot study 4: Senior managers in civil service | 164
4.5.1. Objectives and research questions | 164
4.5.2. Method | 164
4.5.3. Results | 166
4.5.4. Conclusions from pilot study 4 | 166
4.6. Summary | 171

5. **Research model and hypotheses** | 175
5.1. Introduction | 176
5.2. Research model | 176
5.3. Objective and subjective success of the transition | 178
5.4. Personal factors | 181
5.4.1. Socio-demographic factors | 181
5.4.1.1. Gender | 182
5.4.1.2. Age | 184
5.4.1.3. Marital status | 185
5.4.2. Human capital | 187
5.4.2.1. Level of education | 187
5.4.2.2. Managerial experience | 188
5.4.2.3. Readiness for change | 190
5.4.3. Personality traits | 191
5.4.3.1. Adaptability | 191
5.4.3.2. Interpersonal sensitivity | 194
5.4.3.3. Ambition | 196
5.4.3.4. Conceptual skills | 198
5.5. Situational factors | 200
5.5.1. Characteristics of the career transition | 200
5.5.1.1. The objective and subjective magnitude of the transition | 200
5.5.1.2. The objective magnitude of the transition | 201
5.5.1.3. The subjective magnitude of the transition | 203
5.5.2. Sources of support | 204
5.5.2.1. Organizational support | 204
5.5.2.2. Personal social support | 207
5.6. Summary | 208
6.  Methods

6.1.  Introduction

6.2.  Samples

6.2.1.  Sample 1: Construction and engineering company

6.2.1.1.  Preparatory interviews

6.2.1.2.  Online survey

6.2.2.  Sample 2: Global energy consultancy company

6.2.2.1.  Preparatory interviews

6.2.2.2.  Online survey

6.2.3.  Sample 3: HR consultancy firm

6.2.4.  Sample 4: Business school alumni

6.3.  Total sample and response rates

6.4.  Measures

6.4.1.  Indicators of personal factors

6.4.1.1.  Demographic information

6.4.1.2.  Educational level and managerial experience

6.4.1.3.  Readiness for change

6.4.1.4.  Personality traits

6.4.2.  Indicators of situational factors

6.4.2.1.  Characteristics of the career transition

6.4.2.2.  Sources of support

6.4.3.  Objective and subjective success of the transition

7.  Analysis and results

7.1.  Introduction

7.2.  Descriptive statistics

7.2.1.  Main characteristics of the sample

7.2.2.  Statistical reliability of the constructs

7.3.  Correlation matrix

7.4.  Results from the hierarchical regression analysis

7.4.1.  Introduction

7.4.2.  Hypotheses

7.4.2.1.  Relationship between objective and subjective success

7.4.2.2.  Socio-demographics

7.4.2.3.  Human capital

7.4.2.4.  Personality traits

7.4.2.5.  Characteristics of the transition

7.4.2.6.  Sources of support

7.5.  Summary
8. **Conclusions and discussion** 265
8.1. Introduction 266
8.2. Overview of the results 268
8.3. Theoretical implications 270
8.3.1. Age 270
8.3.2. Gender 271
8.3.3. Marital status 272
8.3.4. Level of education 272
8.3.5. Readiness for change and personality traits 273
8.3.6. Characteristics critical career transitions 276
8.3.7. Work-based and non-work-based sources of support 277
8.4. Organizational implications 279
8.5. Implications for individuals 283
8.6. Limitations of the study 284
8.7. Suggestions for further research 286

References 289
Nederlandse samenvatting (Dutch summary) 337
Dankwoord 363

**Appendices** 369
A. Definitions of management 370
B. Definitions of competency and competence 372
C. Definitions of career 373
D. Definitions of career development 375
E. Definitions of management development 376
F. Questionnaire pilot studies 1 and 2 380
G. Questionnaire pilot study 3 382
H. Questionnaire pilot study 4 384
I. Questionnaire quantitative study 386
J. Descriptive statistics 396
K. SPSS output used constructs 397
L. Results factor analysis 400
M. Correlation matrix 1: Pearson's correlation coefficients 401
N. Correlation matrix 2: p-values (1-tailed significance) 402
O. Coefficients objective success (1-tailed) 403
P. Coefficients subjective success (1-tailed) 404
Q. ANOVA tables 405
List of tables

1.1. Overview of theoretical contributions 19
2.1. Taxonomies of managerial activities 30
2.2. Example of the assessment center as a grid of dimensions and situations 32
2.3. The assessment center as a grid 34
2.4. Jansen’s terminology summarized 37
2.5. The 12 types of job change: frequencies for last move 42
2.6. Evaluating role demands for the 12 types of job change 43
2.7. Varieties of career transitions 46
2.8. Types of career transitions 50
2.9. Personal change and role development: four models of work adjustment 54
2.10. Essential transition tasks 56
2.11. Objective magnitude of (intraorganizational) career transitions scale 58
2.12. Four types of subjective career success criteria 67
2.13. Four dimensions or types of career effectiveness 68
2.14. Theoretical distinction between the objective and the subjective elements of careers used in this thesis 74
2.15. Four career concepts 76
2.16. The two components of management development 80
2.17. The management development matrix 83
2.18. Examples and characteristics of developmental components from studies of on-the-job learning 87
2.19. Availability and helpfulness of socialization practices 93
2.20. ‘Single-task-role set’ versus ‘multiple-task-role set’ 106
2.21. Time span, strata of role and domains 107
2.22. Time span and task complexity 110
2.23. The relationship between the leadership strataplex and previous conceptualizations of leadership skill requirement 114
3.1. Passage one: first time management 133
3.2. Critical career transitions and development activities 139
4.1. Overview of pilot studies and groups of respondents 144
4.2. Overview of research questions per group of respondents 144
4.3. Criteria for measuring the success of critical transitions in managerial careers 163
4.4. Number of respondents (managers in Dutch central government) 165
4.5. Results of pilot study 4: intradepartmental transitions 167
4.6. Results of pilot study 4: interdepartmental transitions 169
4.7. Criteria for measuring the success of critical transitions in managerial careers 170
4.8. Criteria of success combined with the four quadrants | 173
5.1. Main differences between careers and critical career transitions | 177
5.2. Summary of the hypotheses | 208
6.1. The focus of the four samples regarding managerial level and intra- and interorganizational transitions | 215
6.2. Total sample, sub samples and response rates | 221
6.3. Overview of respondents in relation to the period since they started in their current managerial job | 222
6.4. The coded effect on income (including bonuses) of the last critical career transition | 233
6.5. Managerial levels and managerial positions | 235
6.6. The coded time spans | 236
7.1. Characteristics of the sample | 243
7.2. Average ages of the four samples | 243
7.3. Number of respondents per managerial level in each sample | 244
7.4. Objective and subjective success per type of job change | 244
7.5. Objective and subjective success of intra- and interorganizational transitions | 245
7.6. Extent of support and effectiveness of developmental activities | 245
7.7. Extent of support and effectiveness of developmental activities per management level | 246
7.8. Extent of support and effectiveness of developmental activities per type of status change | 247
7.9. Change of target completion time, success of the transition and the subjective magnitude | 247
7.10. The statistical reliability of the constructs, including Cronbach's Alpha | 248
7.11. Results of the hierarchical regression analysis | 252
7.12. Summary of the tested hypotheses | 260
List of figures

1.1. Central relations in this study 22
1.2. Structure of this dissertation 23
2.1. The transition cycle 52
2.2. The difficulty and valence related to the magnitude of career transitions 59
2.3. Framework of career transitions 62
2.4. Conceptual model of career success 66
2.5. The positive transition cycle 71
2.6. The negative transition cycle 72
2.7. The hybrid transition cycle 73
2.8. The four career concepts 77
2.9. Management development on the basis of individual and structural-organizational aspects 81
2.10. The leadership skill requirements strataplex 116
2.11. Leadership skill requirements across organizational levels 117
2.12. The CCT-model 120
3.1. The breakeven point of career transitions 125
3.2. As a management career develops, the principal job challenge changes… 127
3.3. The Shell competence matrix 128
3.4. Critical career passages in a large business organization 131
4.1. Criteria for success of critical career transitions: four quadrants 171
5.1. Conceptual model of objective and subjective success of critical career transitions 179

List of text boxes

5.1. Three perspectives on the direction of influence between objective and subjective career success 180
6.1. ‘Readiness for change’ scale 225
6.2. ‘Adaptability scale’ developed by Seegers (2008) 227
6.3. ‘Adaptability’ scale 227
6.4. ‘Interpersonal sensitivity’ scale 229
6.5. ‘Ambition’ scale 231
6.6. ‘Conceptual skills’ scale developed by Enright & Powers (1991) 232
6.7. ‘Conceptual skills’ scale 232
6.8. ‘Subjective magnitude of the transition’ scale 237
6.9. ‘Sources of support’ scale 238
6.10. ‘Objective success of critical career transitions’ scale 238
6.11. ‘Subjective success of critical career transitions’ scale 239