

VU Research Portal

The Quest for the Effective Protection of the Right to Privacy

Wisman, T.H.A.

2019

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Wisman, T. H. A. (2019). *The Quest for the Effective Protection of the Right to Privacy: On the Policy and Rulemaking concerning Mandatory Internet of Things Systems in the European Union*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Chapter 1

Chapter I.....	11
Introduction.....	11
1. Research Context: The Age of Internet of Things	11
2. Applying EU law to the design of mandatory IoT systems.....	18
3. Research question and outline	22
4. Methodology.....	22
Chapter II	27
The right to privacy in the EU legal order	27
1. Introduction	27
2. The scope of the right to private life and the home	29
2.1 The right to private life.....	30
2.2 The home	40
2.3 Positive obligation to protect rights in Article 8 ECHR.....	41
2.4 Reflections on implications for IoT systems	44
3. Requirements for interference with the right to privacy	47
3.1 ‘In accordance with the law’	47
3.2 The element of ‘necessity’, testing proportionality	52
3.3 ‘Essence’ of the right to privacy.....	63
3.4 Implications and conclusions for EU law mandating IoT systems	65
4. Conclusion.....	67
Chapter III.....	71
Data protection in the EU legal order	71
1. Introduction	71
2. The legal regime of Directive 95/46/EC and the GDPR.....	73
2.1 The processing of personal data	76
2.2 Data protection principles.....	77
2.3 Grounds for processing.....	84
2.4 The rights of the data subject.....	88
2.5 The GDPR: changing anchors	89
2.6 Implications for IoT systems	91
3. Article 8 of the Charter: the scope of protection and its limitations.....	93

3.1	The structure of Article 8.....	93
3.2	Confusion about the relation between Article 8 and 7	98
4.	Conclusion.....	101
Chapter IV.....		103
The Commission’s approach to and interpretation of the right to privacy in Internet of Things policy.....		103
1.	Introduction	103
2.	The Commission as a policy maker	106
2.1	Communications on data protection and privacy in general	107
2.2	The role of data in the future economy.....	111
2.3	Communications and recommendations addressed to IoT systems	114
2.4	Taking stock of the Commission’s role as a policymaker.....	115
3.	The Commission in the legislative process	117
3.1	Assessing fundamental rights impacts in a legislative proposal.....	117
3.2	Guarding fundamental rights in the legislative process.....	124
3.3	Consulting the Article 29 Working Party	126
3.4	Additional regulatory instruments	128
4.	The Commission as the ‘executive’	129
4.1	The Commission’s margin of discretion	131
4.2	The request of the Commission to the ESOs.....	139
4.3	The Commission’s attitude towards the ESOs	141
5.	Conclusion.....	144
Chapter V		147
The regulatory framework of the smart meter: a case study.....		147
1.	Introduction	147
2.	The mandatory character of the installation	149
2.1	Installation according to EU law	150
2.2	The goals supposedly served by mandatory installation	151
3.	The functions of the smart meter	156
3.1	Groundwork by the Commission.....	156
3.2	Privacy infringing functions in the Directive	158
3.3	Privacy and data protection in the Directive	161
4.	Impact assessment and Explanatory memorandum	163

4.1	Impact assessment and Explanatory memorandum of the Commission	163
4.2	The Data Protection Impact Assessment Template	165
4.3	The impact assessment & Explanatory memorandum revisited.....	168
5.	Privacy infringing functions and implementing acts.....	176
5.1	Essential elements of smart meter design.....	176
5.2	Instructing the ESOs	178
5.3	The approach to privacy in the Smart Meters-Coordination Group.....	180
6.	Conclusion.....	181
Chapter VI.....		183
Regulatory framework of eCall: case study II		183
1.	Introduction	183
2.	Groundwork by the Commission: making eCall mandatory	185
2.1	Communications framework	185
2.2	Legislative framework	191
3.	The Impact Assessment and Explanatory Memorandum	196
3.1	The Impact Assessment and Explanatory Memorandum of the Commission.....	196
3.2	The Impact Assessment and Explanatory Memorandum revisited	202
4.	Privacy and data protection in eCall legislation.....	214
4.1	Privacy and data protection in the ITS Directive and eCall Regulation.....	214
4.2	Added value services	216
5.	What is left unsettled: the Commission, ESOs and essential elements of design	217
5.1	Instructing the Commission.....	218
5.2	Essential elements of eCall's design	220
5.3	Instructing the ESOs	223
6.	Conclusion.....	224
Chapter VII		227
Conclusion		227
The right to privacy and data protection legislation.....		227
The conflicting roles of the Commission.....		230
The case study of the smart meter and the eCall system.....		234
Concluding thoughts		239
Samenvatting.....		243

Het recht op privacy en gegevensbeschermingswetgeving	244
Conflicterende rollen van de Europese Commissie	245
Vrijheid, autonomie en architectuur	247
BIBLIOGRAPHY	251
Primary Legislation.....	251
European Commission Documents	253
Case Law	257
Other Documents	261
Secondary Sources	265
Miscellaneous Sources	273
Acknowledgements.....	279