

VU Research Portal

A Fight for Scholarly Freedom

Castelli, S.

2019

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Castelli, S. (2019). *A Fight for Scholarly Freedom: Johann Jakob Wettstein's (1693-1754) Principles for New Testament Textual Criticism*.

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Table of Contents

Part One

Introduction

| | |
|--|---|
| 1. Wettstein, Man and Scholar (1693-1754) | 1 |
| 2. Wettstein in Contemporary Text-Critical Scholarship | 3 |
| 3. The Contemporary Need for a Careful Reflexion on Text-Critical Method | 4 |
| 4. Genesis, Research Question and Method | 8 |

Chapter 1. The Urge for New Text-Critical Rules in the Early 18th Century: From Clericus's *Ars Critica* to Bengel's "Prodromus"

| | |
|---|----|
| 1.1. From the Renaissance to Clericus | 11 |
| 1.2. Mill's New Testament and Its Reception | 16 |
| 1.3. Pfaff and von Mastricht | 20 |
| 1.4. Wettstein's <i>Dissertatio</i> | 26 |
| 1.5. Bentley's <i>Proposals</i> | 27 |
| 1.6. Bengel's "Prodromus" and "Notitia" | 29 |

Chapter 2. The Two Editions of Wettstein's Text-Critical Principles

| | |
|--|----|
| 2.1. The Context of the <i>Animadversiones</i> in <i>Prolegomena</i> 1730 and <i>NTG 2</i> | |
| 2.1.1. <i>Prolegomena</i> 1730 on the Manuscripts and Their Evaluation | 33 |
| 2.1.2. <i>Prolegomena</i> 1730 on Versional Evidence and Previous Scholars | 38 |
| 2.1.3 The <i>Animadversiones</i> in the Frame of <i>NTG 2</i> | |
| 2.1.3.1. Why Did Wettstein Place his Text-Critical Principles in <i>NTG 2</i> ? | 40 |
| 2.1.3.2. On the Close Connection of Text-Critical and Hermeneutical Principles | 41 |
| 2.2. Wettstein's Working Tools | |
| 2.2.1 The Interleaved Copy of von Mastricht's <i>NTG</i> , 1711 (Library of the UvA, Amsterdam III H 8-10) | 46 |
| 2.2.2 <i>Prolegomena</i> 1730 with Wettstein's Handwritten Notes (UB Basel Frey-Gryn A IX 85) | 51 |
| 2.3. Editorial Changes to the <i>Animadversiones</i> Chapter in <i>NTG 2</i> | 57 |
| 2.4. Wettstein's Sources and Their Use | |
| 2.4.1. New Testament and Patristic Manuscripts | 59 |
| 2.4.2. Modern and Classical Sources | |
| 2.4.2.1 Galen, Castellio and Newton | 63 |
| 2.4.2.2 Other Sources | 68 |
| 2.4.2.3. On the Use of Sources | 70 |

Chapter 3. Wettstein's Contribution to Text-Critical Theory

| | |
|--|-----|
| Table of Wettstein's Nineteen Principles | 75 |
| 3.1. Basic Principles: A Fight for Scholarly Freedom | 76 |
| 3.1.1. All Text-Critical Tools for The Most Correct New Testament Edition | 77 |
| 3.1.2. Printed Editions are Not Authoritative | |
| 3.1.2.1 On Wettstein's Choice to Print the Received Text | 79 |
| 3.1.2.2 On the Slippery Definition of "Received Text:" the Evidence of Wettstein's <i>Historia Ecclesiastica</i> (Ms 459 Rotterdam Library) | 83 |
| 3.1.3. On Matters of Interpunction and on Relevant and Irrelevant Readings | 87 |
| 3.1.4. On Conjectural Emendation | 90 |
| 3.1.4.1 Wettstein's Background: Philologists and Theologians on Conjectural Emendation | |
| a. Philologists | 92 |
| b. Theologians | 95 |
| 3.1.4.2 Masters of Tolerance | 101 |
| 3.1.4.3 Argument and Ground | 105 |
| 3.1.4.4 Conclusions | 107 |
| 3.2. Internal Criteria | |
| 3.2.1 On the Orthodox Reading | 109 |
| 3.2.1.1 1 Tim 3:16 | 112 |
| 3.2.1.2 1 John 5:7-8 | 121 |
| 3.2.2. <i>Lectio Difficilior Potior, Lectio brevior potior, Usus scribendi</i> | 122 |
| 3.2.2.1 Paternity and Background of the Principle of the Harder Reading | 126 |
| 3.3. Relevance of the Indirect Tradition: Fathers and Versions | 131 |
| 3.4. External Criteria: <i>Lectio Vetustior Potior</i> and <i>Lectio Plurimum Codicum Potior</i> | 137 |
| 3.4.1. Wettstein's Latinization Theory and the Preference for the Older Reading | 137 |
| 3.4.2. The Majority Rule | 142 |
| 3.4.3. <i>Codices Ponderandi Non Numerandi</i> and Conclusions on External Criteria | 145 |
| 3.5. Conclusions | 149 |

Chapter 4. The Textual Critic at Work: Between Theory and Practice

| | |
|---|-----|
| 4.1. Method | 151 |
| 4.2. Preference for the Majority Reading | 153 |
| 4.3. Preference for Internal Criteria | 156 |
| 4.4. Beyond Text-critical Rules | |
| 4.4.1 On Wettstein's Inconsistencies | 160 |
| 4.4.2 On Wettstein's Conjectural Practice | 164 |
| 4.5. A Thoroughgoing Eclectic Critic? | 166 |

Chapter 5. Reception and Legacy of Wettstein's Principles

| | |
|--|-----|
| 5.1 Positive Reception: from the First Reviews of <i>Prolegomena</i> to Griesbach | |
| 5.1.1 The First Reviews and Bowyer | 170 |
| 5.1.2 Semler | 172 |
| 5.1.3 Griesbach | 178 |
| 5.2 Less Favourable or Negative Reception: from the Anonymous Pamphlets to Westcott-Hort | |
| 5.2.1 Anonymous Pamphlets, Driessen, and Bengel | 181 |
| 5.2.2 Michaelis | 188 |
| 5.2.3 Ernesti and Other 18th-Century Scholars | 190 |
| 5.2.4 From Lachmann to Westcott-Hort | 194 |
| 5.3 Criticisms to the Genealogical Method and Wettstein's Rediscovery in the 20th century | |
| 5.3.1 Bédier and Pasquali | 197 |
| 5.3.2 Eclecticism and CBGM | 200 |
| 5.4. Wettstein's Lasting Legacy | |
| 5.4.1 A Fight for Scholarly Freedom: Going Beyond the Received Text in Search of a New Method | 202 |
| 5.4.2 On the Crucial Value of the Critic's Judgment: The Continuing Importance of Reflection on Internal Criteria | 204 |
| 5.4.3 A Plea for the Legitimacy of Conjectural Emendation | 205 |
| 5.4.4 A 18th Century "Historical Turn" | 207 |
| Summary and Conclusion | 210 |
| Desiderata | 214 |
| Appendix: Manuscripts Personally Inspected by Wettstein by 1730 | 216 |

Part Two

Introduction: Editing the Text of *Prolegomena* 1730

| | |
|---|-----|
| 1. The Text | |
| 1.1. Spelling and Punctuation, Layout | 225 |
| 1.2. Errors, Abbreviations, Greek, Capital Letters, Italic | 227 |
| 2. Apparatus criticus | 229 |
| Conspectus Siglorum | 229 |
| <i>Animadversiones et cautiones ad examen Variarum Lectionum N.T. necessariae</i> | 230 |
| Bibliography | 310 |