

# VU Research Portal

## A Fight for Scholarly Freedom

Castelli, S.

2019

### **document version**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

### **citation for published version (APA)**

Castelli, S. (2019). *A Fight for Scholarly Freedom: Johann Jakob Wettstein's (1693-1754) Principles for New Testament Textual Criticism*.

### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

### **E-mail address:**

[vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl](mailto:vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl)

# Table of Contents

## Part One

### Introduction

1. Wettstein, Man and Scholar (1693-1754)	1
2. Wettstein in Contemporary Text-Critical Scholarship	3
3. The Contemporary Need for a Careful Reflexion on Text-Critical Method	4
4. Genesis, Research Question and Method	8

### Chapter 1. The Urge for New Text-Critical Rules in the Early 18th Century: From Clericus's *Ars Critica* to Bengel's "Prodromus"

1.1. From the Renaissance to Clericus	11
1.2. Mill's New Testament and Its Reception	16
1.3. Pfaff and von Mastricht	20
1.4. Wettstein's <i>Dissertatio</i>	26
1.5. Bentley's <i>Proposals</i>	27
1.6. Bengel's "Prodromus" and "Notitia"	29

### Chapter 2. The Two Editions of Wettstein's Text-Critical Principles

2.1. The Context of the <i>Animadversiones</i> in <i>Prolegomena</i> 1730 and <i>NTG 2</i>	
2.1.1. <i>Prolegomena</i> 1730 on the Manuscripts and Their Evaluation	33
2.1.2. <i>Prolegomena</i> 1730 on Versional Evidence and Previous Scholars	38
2.1.3 The <i>Animadversiones</i> in the Frame of <i>NTG 2</i>	
2.1.3.1. Why Did Wettstein Place his Text-Critical Principles in <i>NTG 2</i> ?	40
2.1.3.2. On the Close Connection of Text-Critical and Hermeneutical Principles	41
2.2. Wettstein's Working Tools	
2.2.1 The Interleaved Copy of von Mastricht's <i>NTG</i> , 1711 (Library of the UvA, Amsterdam III H 8-10)	46
2.2.2 <i>Prolegomena</i> 1730 with Wettstein's Handwritten Notes (UB Basel Frey-Gryn A IX 85)	51
2.3. Editorial Changes to the <i>Animadversiones</i> Chapter in <i>NTG 2</i>	57
2.4. Wettstein's Sources and Their Use	
2.4.1. New Testament and Patristic Manuscripts	59
2.4.2. Modern and Classical Sources	
2.4.2.1 Galen, Castellio and Newton	63
2.4.2.2 Other Sources	68
2.4.2.3. On the Use of Sources	70

## Chapter 3. Wettstein's Contribution to Text-Critical Theory

Table of Wettstein's Nineteen Principles	75
3.1. Basic Principles: A Fight for Scholarly Freedom	76
3.1.1. All Text-Critical Tools for The Most Correct New Testament Edition	77
3.1.2. Printed Editions are Not Authoritative	
3.1.2.1 On Wettstein's Choice to Print the Received Text	79
3.1.2.2 On the Slippery Definition of "Received Text:" the Evidence of Wettstein's <i>Historia Ecclesiastica</i> (Ms 459 Rotterdam Library )	83
3.1.3. On Matters of Interpunction and on Relevant and Irrelevant Readings	87
3.1.4. On Conjectural Emendation	90
3.1.4.1 Wettstein's Background: Philologists and Theologians on Conjectural Emendation	
a. Philologists	92
b. Theologians	95
3.1.4.2 Masters of Tolerance	101
3.1.4.3 Argument and Ground	105
3.1.4.4 Conclusions	107
3.2. Internal Criteria	
3.2.1 On the Orthodox Reading	109
3.2.1.1 1 Tim 3:16	112
3.2.1.2 1 John 5:7-8	121
3.2.2. <i>Lectio Difficilior Potior, Lectio brevior potior, Usus scribendi</i>	122
3.2.2.1 Paternity and Background of the Principle of the Harder Reading	126
3.3. Relevance of the Indirect Tradition: Fathers and Versions	131
3.4. External Criteria: <i>Lectio Vetustior Potior</i> and <i>Lectio Plurimum Codicum Potior</i>	137
3.4.1. Wettstein's Latinization Theory and the Preference for the Older Reading	137
3.4.2. The Majority Rule	142
3.4.3. <i>Codices Ponderandi Non Numerandi</i> and Conclusions on External Criteria	145
3.5. Conclusions	149

## Chapter 4. The Textual Critic at Work: Between Theory and Practice

4.1. Method	151
4.2. Preference for the Majority Reading	153
4.3. Preference for Internal Criteria	156
4.4. Beyond Text-critical Rules	
4.4.1 On Wettstein's Inconsistencies	160
4.4.2 On Wettstein's Conjectural Practice	164
4.5. A Thoroughgoing Eclectic Critic?	166

## Chapter 5. Reception and Legacy of Wettstein's Principles

5.1 Positive Reception: from the First Reviews of <i>Prolegomena</i> to Griesbach	
5.1.1 The First Reviews and Bowyer	170
5.1.2 Semler	172
5.1.3 Griesbach	178
5.2 Less Favourable or Negative Reception: from the Anonymous Pamphlets to Westcott-Hort	
5.2.1 Anonymous Pamphlets, Driessen, and Bengel	181
5.2.2 Michaelis	188
5.2.3 Ernesti and Other 18th-Century Scholars	190
5.2.4 From Lachmann to Westcott-Hort	194
5.3 Criticisms to the Genealogical Method and Wettstein's Rediscovery in the 20th century	
5.3.1 Bédier and Pasquali	197
5.3.2 Eclecticism and CBGM	200
5.4. Wettstein's Lasting Legacy	
5.4.1 A Fight for Scholarly Freedom: Going Beyond the Received Text in Search of a New Method	202
5.4.2 On the Crucial Value of the Critic's Judgment: The Continuing Importance of Reflection on Internal Criteria	204
5.4.3 A Plea for the Legitimacy of Conjectural Emendation	205
5.4.4 A 18th Century "Historical Turn"	207
Summary and Conclusion	210
Desiderata	214
Appendix: Manuscripts Personally Inspected by Wettstein by 1730	216

## Part Two

### Introduction: Editing the Text of *Prolegomena* 1730

1. The Text	
1.1. Spelling and Punctuation, Layout	225
1.2. Errors, Abbreviations, Greek, Capital Letters, Italic	227
2. Apparatus criticus	229
Conspectus Siglorum	229
<i>Animadversiones et cautiones ad examen Variarum Lectionum N.T. necessariae</i>	230
Bibliography	310