

VU Research Portal

Tax Treaty Residence of Entities

Gooijer, J.

2019

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Gooijer, J. (2019). *Tax Treaty Residence of Entities*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Contents

List of abbreviations	13
-----------------------	----

PART I - INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1	17
------------------	-----------

Purpose, methodology and structure

1.1 The importance of the resident definition for tax treaty purposes	17
1.2 Purpose and research questions	20
1.3 Approach	21
1.4 Structure	23
1.5 Delimitations	24

PART II - FRAMEWORK FOR INTERPRETATION OF ARTICLE 4 OECD MC

Chapter 2	27
------------------	-----------

The history of the residency of entities under Model Tax Conventions

2.1 The League of Nations Models	27
2.1.1 League of Nations: the report of the four economists	28
2.1.2 League of Nations: the 1925 report	29
2.1.3 League of Nations: the 1927 draft model	31
2.1.4 League of Nations: the 1928 Model Treaty	32
2.1.5 The League of Nations' work during the 1930s	32
2.1.6 The 1940 Carroll study	35
2.1.7 The Mexico and London model	36
2.1.8 Concluding remarks	36
2.2 The OECD Models	37
2.2.1 The draft OECD MC 1963	37
2.2.2 The work of WP14 on the personal scope of the Convention	47
2.2.3 The 1977 additions	48
2.2.4 The 1992 additions: improper use of tax treaties and conduit companies	51
2.2.5 Interaction between the Articles 2 and 4	54
2.2.6 The 2000 additions: residence as a source-rule and the POEM-concept	54
2.2.7 The work of the TAG on POEM	58
2.2.8 The 2008 additions to the Commentary on Article 4(1) and (3) OECD MC	59
2.2.9 2017 amendments as result of the BEPS project	60
2.2.10 Concluding remarks	62
2.3 Conclusions	63

Chapter 3	65
The use of the provisions on tax treaty interpretation in this study	
3.1 Article 3(2) OECD MC	65
3.2 Articles 31 and 32 VCLT	68
3.2.1 Good faith	69
3.2.2 Ordinary meaning	69
3.2.3 Context	70
3.2.4 Object and purpose of tax treaties	70
3.2.5 Relevant rules of international law	71
3.2.6 Supplementary means of interpretation	73
3.3 A framework for interpretative purposes	73
3.4 The use of the Commentary on the OECD MC, historical documentation and case law in the interpretation of tax treaties	75
3.4.1 Commentary on the OECD MC	75
3.4.2 Historical documents	76
3.4.3 Case law	77
3.5 Summary and conclusion	77
Chapter 4	79
Object and purpose	79
4.1 Title and preamble of the OECD MC	79
4.2 Introduction to the OECD MC	81
4.3 The OECD MC as a whole	81
4.4 Commentary on the OECD MC	83
4.5 Object and purpose of Article 4	85
4.6 Concluding remarks on the object and purpose of the OECD MC and the interpretation of Article 4	85
PART III - INTERPRETATION OF ARTICLE 4 OECD MC	
<hr/>	
Chapter 5	91
Entities as residents for tax treaty purposes (Article 4(1))	
5.1 Criteria for residence taxation by France, Germany, the Netherlands, the UK and the US	92
5.1.1 France	93
5.1.2 Germany	95
5.1.3 Netherlands	100

5.1.4	United Kingdom	112
5.1.5	United States	120
5.1.6	Conclusion	121
5.2	Whether the context requires another meaning	122
5.3	Any person	124
5.4	Laws	124
5.4.1	'Laws' as the whole body of domestic law that determines residency	124
5.4.2	Context: use of 'laws' in other OECD MC provisions	125
5.4.3	Context: Commentary on Article 4(1)	126
5.4.4	Conclusion	127
5.5	Liable to tax	127
5.5.1	Meaning of 'liable to tax'	127
5.5.2	Liable to tax 'by reason of'	128
5.5.3	'Liable to tax': unlimited tax liability?	140
5.5.4	'Liable to tax': formal or effective tax liability?	147
5.5.5	The term 'tax'	167
5.5.6	Conclusion	172
5.6	Article 4(1), second sentence	173
5.6.1	Liability to tax in the sense of Article 4(1), second sentence	173
5.6.2	"Sources in that State or capital situated therein"	175
5.6.3	The second sentence and entities	179
5.6.4	Conclusions	187
5.7	Summary and conclusion	188
5.7.1	Article 4(1), first sentence	189
5.7.2	Article 4(1), second sentence	181

Chapter 6 **193**

Entities as residents for tax treaty purposes under the tie-breaker rule (Article 4(3))

6.1	Tie breaker in the 2014 OECD MC: POEM	194
6.1.1	Domestic meaning of POEM	195
6.1.2	Whether the context requires another meaning	195
6.1.3	Ordinary meaning of POEM	196
6.1.4	Other references to POEM in the OECD MC	197
6.1.5	The OECD Commentary and the concept of POEM	197
6.1.6	Preliminary conclusion	199
6.1.7	Case law	199
6.1.8	Concluding remarks as regards POEM	209

6.2 Tie-breaker in the 2017 OECD MC: the MAP-provision	212
6.2.1 Criteria used in the MAP	212
6.2.2 Object and purpose	213
6.2.3 No agreement on residency	214
6.2.4 Concluding remarks on the MAP-provision	217
6.3 Conclusions	218

PART IV - A NOVEL RESIDENT DEFINITION

Chapter 7 **221**

Prerequisites for a novel definition of resident

7.1 Justification of the recognition of entities as residents	223
7.1.1 Anti-deferral function of corporate taxation	223
7.1.2 Compensation for benefits received	225
7.1.3 The principle of non-discrimination	226
7.1.4 Concluding remarks on the theoretical foundations of residence based corporate taxation and the residence concept	226
7.2 Tax jurisdiction, corporate taxation and the residence concept	228
7.2.1 The basis of tax jurisdiction	228
7.2.2 The use of tax jurisdiction in accordance with the principle of sovereign equality	231
7.2.3 The use of tax jurisdiction in a globalized world	233
7.2.4 Concluding remarks on tax jurisdiction, corporate taxation and the residence concept	234
7.3 Role of the residence definition	235
7.4 Concluding remarks on the prerequisites for the definition of resident	240
7.4.1 Summary	240
7.4.2 Concluding remarks	241

Chapter 8 **245**

A novel resident definition

8.1 Reference to domestic concepts as a starting point	247
8.2 Introduction of a threshold for substantial nexus	249
8.2.1 The 'active conduct of a business'-test in Article 29(3) OECD MC	249
8.2.2 The PE as a threshold for substantial nexus?	257
8.2.3 Concluding remarks and proposal for a threshold for substantial nexus	261
8.3 Third country residents as residents for treaty purposes	264
8.4 Treaty eligibility of non-qualifying entities	267

8.4.1 Pension funds, charities, endowments and the like	267
8.4.2 Investment Vehicles	268
8.4.3 Real Estate Entities	270
8.4.4 Entities with a PE in the other contracting state	271
8.5 The relevance of the attribution and (actual) taxation of income	271
8.5.1 Wheeler's approach on the relevance of the attribution and (actual) taxation of income for treaty eligibility	271
8.5.2 References to the income in the proposed definition of resident	274
8.6 Tie breaker provision	275
8.6.1 Necessity of a tie-breaker provision under the proposed resident definition	276
8.6.2 Proposal of a tie breaker provision	279
8.7 Effect of the proposed definition under DTCs with third countries	282
8.8 The proposed definition in relation to Article 29 OECD MC	284
8.8.1 The LOB provision	284
8.8.2 Low-taxed PE	285
8.8.3 The Principal Purpose Test	285
8.9 Concluding remarks and final proposal for a novel resident definition	288
8.9.1 Overview of relevant considerations	289
8.9.2 Proposal	292
8.9.3 Similarities and differences	293

PART V - CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 9	299
Conclusions	299
9.1 Evaluation of the effect of Article 4(1) and 4(3) OECD MC if applied to entities	300
9.1.1 Answers to the sub-questions 1 to 5	300
9.1.2 Conclusion	313
9.2 Prerequisites for a treaty definition of resident	314
9.3 Proposal for a novel treaty definition of resident	316
9.4 Conclusion	320
References	323
Summary	347
Samenvatting	353