

VU Research Portal

The Specific Vulnerability of Religious Minorities

Petri, D.P.

2020

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Petri, D. P. (2020). *The Specific Vulnerability of Religious Minorities*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Table of contents

Table of contents	3
Table of figures	7
Acknowledgements	9
Abbreviations	13
1. Introduction	15
1.1 <i>Initial observations</i>	15
1.1.1 Religious minorities possess a demonstrable vulnerability for suffering human rights abuses.	16
1.1.2 From the perspective of human security, the enforcement of religious freedom poses challenges, especially in subnational areas with weak rule of law and weak state capacity.....	17
1.1.3 Non-state actors, including ethnic groups and organized crime, can create vulnerability for religious minorities.	18
1.1.4 There seems to be a relation between the behavior of religious minorities and their vulnerability to suffer human rights abuses.....	19
1.1.5 Religion appears to be a factor, among other factors, of the vulnerability of religious minorities.	20
1.1.6 Religious minorities possess a specific vulnerability for suffering human rights abuses.	22
1.1.7 Religious minorities use or could use mechanisms to cope with human security threats.	23
1.2 <i>Justification</i>	23
1.2.1 Societal relevance	23
1.2.2 Academic relevance.....	24
1.3 <i>Aim of this research</i>	25
1.4 <i>Research questions</i>	26
1.5 <i>Definitions of key concepts</i>	27
1.5.1 Religion	27
1.5.2 Religious minority	28
1.5.3 Vulnerability.....	30
1.5.4 Specificity.....	30
1.6 <i>Case study exploration</i>	31
1.7 <i>Reading guide</i>	33
2. Human security and the specific vulnerability of religious minorities	35
2.1 <i>Ways to understand the reasons behind the vulnerability of religious minorities</i>	35
2.1.1 The relation between religious identity and vulnerability.....	35
2.1.2 Vulnerability as a result of deviant social behavior	37
2.1.3 The specific vulnerability of commitment to justice.....	39
2.1.4 State regulation of religion	40
2.2 <i>When vulnerability becomes conflict: understanding ethno-religious conflict in conflict theory</i>	43
2.2.1 Grievance.....	43
2.2.2 Greed	44
2.2.3 Opportunity.....	45
2.3 <i>Coping with vulnerability: resilience</i>	46
2.3.1 Resilience.....	46
2.3.2 Coping mechanisms	47
2.4 <i>Synthesis: pieces to the puzzle of the vulnerability of religious minorities</i>	51
3. Strengths and shortcomings of religious freedom assessment tools from a human security perspective	55
3.1 <i>Evaluation of religious freedom assessment tools</i>	55

3.1.1	Origins	55
3.1.2	Methodological review	59
3.1.3	Contributions	60
3.1.4	Shortcomings	61
3.1.5	Synthesis: the limited value of Religious Freedom Assessment Tools.....	64
3.2	<i>Gaining from the human security perspective</i>	64
3.2.1	The relevance of human security for the observation of the vulnerability of religious minorities ..	65
3.2.2	Operationalization of the human security perspective to assess the vulnerability of religious minorities	66
3.3	<i>The multidimensionality of religious freedom</i>	69
3.3.1	Spheres of society	69
3.3.2	Connections between key concepts.....	70
3.3.3	Discarded concepts	71
3.4	<i>Towards a new perspective</i>	73
4.	The Religious Minorities Vulnerability Assessment Tool.....	75
4.1	<i>Requirements of a new tool</i>	75
4.2	<i>Construction of the Religious Minorities Vulnerability Assessment Tool</i>	77
4.2.1	Context of the case study	78
4.2.2	Threat assessment	80
4.2.3	Specificity assessment	82
4.2.4	Resilience assessment	84
4.3	<i>Case study selection</i>	85
4.3.1	Active religious behavior.....	87
4.3.2	Clearly distinguishable group	87
4.3.3	Failing rule of law and undemocratic regime	87
4.3.4	Blind spots on Religious Freedom Assessment Tools	88
4.3.5	Potential for generalization and analytical contribution	88
4.3.6	Specificity	89
4.3.7	Analytical relevance of coping mechanisms.....	89
4.4	<i>Data collection</i>	90
4.5	<i>Security risks and ethical challenges</i>	91
4.6	<i>Concluding remarks: a new tool</i>	92
5.	The vulnerability of actively practicing Christians caused by criminal violence in the states of Nuevo León, Tamaulipas, and San Luis Potosí, Mexico	93
5.1	<i>The unexplored relation between organized crime and religious freedom</i>	94
5.1.1	Actively practicing Christians, a minority within Mexican Christianity	94
5.1.2	Subnational democratic challenges and cartel violence in northeast Mexico	96
5.1.3	The overlooked role of organized crime on Religious Freedom Assessment Tools	101
5.1.4	The vulnerability of actively practicing Christians to organized crime	103
5.2	<i>Data collection</i>	104
5.3	<i>Security risks and ethical challenges</i>	105
5.4	<i>Assessment phase</i>	106
5.4.1	Threat assessment	107
5.4.2	Specificity assessment	117
5.4.3	Resilience assessment.....	121
5.5	<i>Evaluation</i>	125
5.5.1	Contributions	126
5.5.2	Limitations.....	127
6.	The vulnerability of cultural dissidents among the Nasa ethnic group in the <i>resguardos indígenas</i> of the southwestern highlands of Colombia.....	129

6.1	<i>The disregard for religious freedom in the Nasa resguardos indígenas</i>	129
6.1.1	The religious agenda of cultural dissidents within the Nasa ethnic group	130
6.1.2	Legal insecurity and religious tensions in the Nasa resguardos.....	133
6.1.3	The repression of cultural dissidents.....	138
6.2	<i>Data collection</i>	139
6.3	<i>Security risks and ethical challenges</i>	141
6.4	<i>Assessment phase</i>	142
6.4.1	Threat assessment	142
6.4.2	Specificity assessment	159
6.4.3	Resilience assessment.....	161
6.5	<i>Evaluation</i>	165
6.5.1	Contributions	165
6.5.2	Limitations.....	167
7.	The vulnerability of Christians in Cuba	169
7.1	<i>The regulation of religion by the Cuban authoritarian regime</i>	169
7.1.1	The differentiated treatment of Christians by the Cuban government.	170
7.1.2	Changes and continuity in Cuba’s religious policy.....	173
7.1.3	The ongoing vulnerability of Christians in Cuba.....	177
7.2	<i>Data collection</i>	178
7.3	<i>Security risks and ethical challenges</i>	180
7.4	<i>Assessment phase</i>	181
7.4.1	Threat assessment	181
7.4.2	Specificity assessment	198
7.4.3	Resilience assessment.....	202
7.5	<i>Evaluation</i>	210
7.5.1	Contributions	210
7.5.2	Limitations.....	211
8.	Reflection on the specific vulnerability of religious minorities	213
8.1	<i>Empirical value of the case studies</i>	213
8.1.1	Summary of findings	213
8.1.2	Comparison.....	218
8.2	<i>Reflection on the research process</i>	221
8.3	<i>Methodological evaluation of the Religious Minorities Vulnerability Assessment Tool</i>	223
8.3.1	Methodological innovations.....	223
8.3.2	Scope of empirical observation.....	224
8.3.3	Replicability.....	226
8.3.4	Generalizability and comparability.....	226
8.3.5	Determination of specificity	227
8.3.6	Synthesis: the RM-VAT as a complement to other tools and frameworks.....	228
8.4	<i>Contributions to the literature</i>	228
8.4.1	Applications of interpretative models of the vulnerability of religious minorities	229
8.4.2	Improvements to Religious Freedom Assessment Tools	231
8.4.3	Developing human security	232
8.5	<i>Exploration of possible areas for future research</i>	234
8.5.1	Areas for future research that arise from the case studies.....	234
8.5.2	Broader applications of the Religious Minorities Vulnerability Assessment Tool.....	236
8.5.3	Development of the Religious Minorities Vulnerability Assessment Tool.....	237
8.6	<i>Implications for religious minorities, faith-based organizations and human rights agencies</i>	239
8.6.1	Comments on intervention strategies to develop the resilience of vulnerable religious minorities	239

8.6.2	The role religious groups could play to mitigate the impact of organized crime	245
8.6.3	Policy recommendations to address minority-within-the-minority conflicts	247
8.6.4	Recommendations for religious minorities in authoritarian regimes	249
9.	Summary	251
10.	Samenvatting	253
	References	257
	Annexes.....	275
A.	Papers and conferences based on this dissertation	275
B.	Scores of Colombia, Cuba and Mexico on Religious Freedom Assessment Tools (most recent publications).....	277
C.	Violent incidents of persecution against Christians in Colombia, Cuba and Mexico (2011-2018).....	280
D.	Comparison of Religious Freedom Assessment Tools.....	282
E.	Spheres of society.....	291
F.	Geographical localization of the Nasa (Páez) ethnic group in Colombia	292
G.	Legal synthesis: indigenous communities in Colombian legislation.....	295
H.	Examples of religious freedom cases in Colombian and Inter-American jurisprudence.....	297
I.	Registered Protestant denominations in Cuba	299
J.	Definitions of key concepts used in this research.....	301

Table of figures

4.1 The interaction between specific vulnerability and resilience	77
4.2 Continuum of religious identity and behavior	79
4.3 Tool for the assessment of human security threats by sphere of society.....	82
4.4 Degree of specificity of the vulnerability of the religious minority to identified threats	83
4.5 Categorization of coping mechanisms of religious minorities.....	84
5.1 Categories of religious identity and behavior by % of total population in Nuevo León, Tamaulipas and San Luis Potosí (Mexico).....	95
5.2 Map of the states of Nuevo León, Tamaulipas and San Luis Potosí (Mexico).....	97
5.3 Threat assessment of actively practicing Christians in Nuevo León, Tamaulipas and San Luis Potosí (Mexico).....	107
5.4 Specificity assessment of threats against actively practicing Christians in Nuevo León, Tamaulipas and San Luis Potosí (Mexico)	118
6.1 Map of the southwestern highlands of Colombia (Cauca and neighboring departments).....	133
6.2 Threat assessment of cultural dissidents in Nasa resguardos (Colombia).....	143
6.3 Specificity assessment of threats against cultural dissidents in Nasa resguardos (Colombia)	159
7.1 Map of Cuba.....	169
7.2 Degrees of pressure depending on type of recognition of Christian denomination or church (Cuba)	170
7.3 Threat assessment of Christians (Cuba)	182
7.4 Specificity assessment of threats against Christians (Cuba)	198
8.1 Synthesis of intervention strategies by religious minorities, faith-based organizations and human rights agencies.....	245

